DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 249 831 HE 017 717

AUTHOR de Moor, R. A.; Vedel, Doyer Georges
TITLE Reform and Development of Tertiary Education in Europe. Recommendations.
INSTITUTION Council of Europe, Strasbourg (France).
PUB DATE 82
NOTE 104p.; Small print throughout; some portions of light or broken type.
AVAILABLE FROM Council of Europe, Documentation Centre for Education in Europe, BP 431 R6, Strasbourg, Cedex, France F-67006.
PUB TYPE Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC05 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Access to Education; College Administration; College Programs; *College Role; College Students; *Educational Change; Educational Objectives; *Educational Policy; Education Work Relationship; Foreign Countries; *Geographic Regions; Labor Market; *Postsecondary Education
IDENTIFIERS Cyprus; *Europe (South); *Europe (West); France; Greece; Italy; Netherlands; Norway; Portugal; Spain; Sweden; Switzerland; Turkey; United Kingdom; West Germany

ABSTRACT

Tertiary education policies in seven Western European and seven Southern European countries are evaluated in two reports. In the first report by R. A. de Moor, attention is focused on France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, and the United Kingdom. The evaluation and policy recommendations for the future concern: the integration of higher education policy with tertiary education policy; goals of education (labor force development, research, cultural and community function, personal growth); access to tertiary education; the effectiveness and efficiency of tertiary education; the student body and college programs; and educational policy and the labor market. The second report, prepared by Georges Vedel, covers tertiary education policy in Cyprus, France, Greece, Italy, Portugal, Spain, and Turkey. Consideration is given to general characteristics of the Southern Europe area, goals and function of tertiary education, the place of tertiary education in the system as a whole, the components of tertiary education, the administration of tertiary education, the human factor in tertiary education, and diversification. (SW)

**********
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
**********

COUNCIL OF EUROPE

CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

EDUCATION & CULTURE

ED249831

# Reform and development of tertiary education in Europe

## Recommendations

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Council of Europe

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

HE 012 712

2
Strasbourg 1983

HIGHER EDUCATION AND RESEARCH

# Reform and development of tertiary education in Europe

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Strasbourg 1982

HIGHER EDUCATION AND RESEARCH

Analysis and evaluation of tertiary education policy

Part I: in seven Western European countries :
France, Federal Republic of Germany,
Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland,
United Kingdom

Part II: in seven Southern European countries :
Cyprus, Spain, France, Greece, Italy,
Portugal, Turkey

CONTENTS


Part I

Page

- Analysis and evaluation of tertiary education policy in seven Western European countries: France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, the United Kingdom ..... 1

Part II

- Analysis and evaluation of tertiary education policy in seven Western European countries: Cyprus, France, Greece, Italy, Portugal, Spain, Turkey ..... 42

# PART I

## Analysis and Evaluation of Tertiary Education Policy in Seven Western European Countries: France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, the United Kingdom (1)

## RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE POLICY

Original draft by the Rapporteur of the Working Party:

Professor R A de MOOR,

Catholic University of Tilburg (Netherlands).

(1) The national reports are published in "Changing tertiary education in modern European society", Part I, edited in 1978.

Analysis and Evaluation of Tertiary Education Policy in Seven Western European Countries. Recommendations for Future Policy

## 1. Introduction

Diversification is a keyword of educational policy in the seventies. As a policy it refers to the need for a variety of educational structures and means to cater for a student body greatly differing as to age, previous schooling, social experience, educational objectives and opportunities for study. In a policy of diversification the aspect of co-ordination needs to be stressed in order to achieve a diversified, but at the same time integrated system.

In Roselyne Crausaz's report Diversification of Tertiary Education (1) the Working Party analysed these various elements of a diversification policy and published the first results of its study on tertiary education in The Federal Republic of Germany, Norway, Switzerland, France and the United Kingdom. The interim report (2), published in 1976, dealt with problems and developments observed after 1974, and at that time the Netherlands and Sweden were also included in the study. This final report is not meant as a supplement to the two preceding ones, giving only the most recent developments and their evaluation by the Working Party. Without repeating the information given in those reports, the Working Party intends now to give a final analysis and evaluation of tertiary education policy in the seven countries. These countries have at least two characteristics in common, which are important for their educational policy : they are technologically advanced and they are increasingly emphasising democratic values in all spheres of life.

Notwithstanding these and other similar conditions, however, it is not the case that there is only one proper tertiary education policy for them, even if educational needs and the main problems to be solved by policy are similar. Educational systems are in manifold ways interwoven with other sectors of society. And societies are different in the seven countries : different in their values, at least in the hierarchy of them, different in their socio-economic and political structure. They have been so in the past, and this has led to different patterns of education that cannot be ignored in reforms.

---

(1) Council for Cultural Co-operation, Council of Europe, Strasbourg 1974.

(2) R A de Moor. Recent developments and problems in the Diversification of Tertiary Education. CCC/ESR (76), 65 revised Strasbourg, 6 October 1976.

Moreover, reforms are part of politics. Non-educational interests, values and responsibilities are, therefore, involved in them. It will be obvious, therefore, that there is no single solution to opt for.

In the successive sections the various policy elements will be analysed and evaluated. Each section will be concluded by recommendations of the working party.

Although the working party has worked in great harmony, it will be understood that not every view expressed is shared by each of its members without qualification or reservation.

2. Higher education or tertiary education ?

In most of the seven countries secondary education has become comprehensive (integrated schools) or is in the process of becoming more-or-less comprehensive. In all countries participation in secondary education until the age of 17 or 18 will grow almost universal. Even if upper secondary education policy is deliberately aiming at preparing a large proportion of youngsters for the labour-market - which it is often not - it may, therefore, be expected that an increasing percentage of an age cohort will also participate in education after the age of 17/18, either immediately after leaving secondary school or at a later stage of life. It is difficult to say what this percentage, ultimately, will be, but the intellectual preparation and orientation of participants will certainly become more heterogeneous, and more less intellectually gifted persons will participate who need programmes other than the present educational offerings of universities and equivalent institutions.

It is the Working Party's impression that this fact of a student population becoming increasingly different in abilities, experiences and (future) careers is not fully taken into account by most governments. Only Sweden has broadened its concept of higher education - and has based a coherent policy on this - to all education catering for people over 17-19 years old. In most countries the tendency is to look upon diversification of higher education rather exclusively as a policy of creating alternative programmes for university studies, alternative programmes which take less time and/or are more labour-market oriented, but nevertheless of equal attractiveness. To propagate these alternative programmes much emphasis is laid on their equivalence to traditional programmes. It often, however, remains unclear what equivalence, in this respect, means : equally useful for society and/or

for personal growth, preparing for careers of equal prestige, assuring similar income prospects, being of similar educational standards ? Confusion as to what really is in the mind of policy makers may be attributable to a concern to stress equivalence rather than differentiation. Diversification in the sense of creating shorter and/or more labour market oriented programmes as alternatives for traditional university programmes is admittedly a necessary first step in countries where long, discipline-and-research-oriented university programmes are almost the only ones available. It would, however, be too narrow a view of policy potential to regard diversification mainly as a substitute for expanding traditional university programmes. A future system of post-secondary education will demand a greater variety of educational provision, in terms of purposes and levels, than is implied in such a policy.

Present policies are still too much influenced by the traditional concept of higher education which is connected with the ideas of intellectual depth and academic standards. There is no denying that advanced programmes, exacting high intellectual abilities of teachers and students, deserve great attention in our knowledge-based societies. They are included in the concept of diversification. If, however, post-secondary education policy is kept within the limits of the traditional concept of higher education, diversification in its fullest sense will have no chance. And when a strict dividing line is drawn between higher education and other post-secondary education their interdependence is ignored.

Co-ordination of diversified programmes in the same field of study and of the institutions offering them, design of routes through these programmes, co-ordination of admission rules, planning and financing demand the interdependence of programmes and institutions to be recognised. It is no longer obvious that, from a government's policy point of view, the boundaries of educational sectors have to be based on purposes and/or intellectual demands of programmes. Tertiary education will therefore be used in this report to refer to the preferred system, higher education to indicate the present system.

Tertiary education thus embraces all education for youth and adults beginning at the age of 17-19, depending on the countries' educational systems, and requiring either completion of secondary education, or at least three or four years of secondary schooling with some years of practical experience. In countries where pupils at the end of school-age have to transfer to another school system, as now in Sweden and Norway, it may even be desirable, to achieve a coherent policy, to use the distinction between compulsory and non-compulsory education as the most fundamental one.

It can be doubted whether it will be possible to make a clear-cut distinction, in tertiary education, between higher and non-higher education. But even if it can be done and if it is useful, for policy reasons, to do so, higher education has to be considered as part of an integrated system of tertiary education. The Working Party wants to stress that diversification and integration have to be inseparable goals of policy. Diversification requires stimulation from central policy-makers as well as initiative, and room for action, of individual institutions. In countries like the Netherlands and Switzerland this last element may suit the traditionally important role of private (denominational) initiative. The need for integration requires in all countries central co-ordination.

The working party recommends :

- that governments' policies should be directed towards developing a system of tertiary education, diversified as to purposes and levels of programmes, and to planning tertiary education as a single system. Higher education policy should be broadened to become tertiary education policy.

3. The goals of educational policy

Why is society willing to spend a considerable part of its resources on tertiary education ? The answer is given by stating the goals of educational policy. These goals have to be defined explicitly and made as specific as possible to allow a deliberate educational policy. For they are criteria to set priorities and they are guidelines for the design both of programmes and single courses, and for admission and selection policy.

Preparation for the labour market

One of the arguments in the sixties for the expansion of higher education was its contribution to economic growth. Since then the orientation to the labour market has become still more noticeable in higher education policy. To provide qualified and usable manpower will remain a main function of tertiary education in knowledge-based societies. This is stressed by human capital theorists.

In part to further a labour market orientation of an expanding system the British Government decided, already in the sixties, to create a second sector of higher education alongside the universities by developing polytechnics as institutions of equal esteem.

Norway established district colleges to provide, in particular, professional short-cycle courses of university level. The Swedish Reform Act 1975 assigns to tertiary education explicitly the function of preparing for the labour market. In the Federal Republic of Germany since 1970 Fachhochschulen were created as successors to the Ingenieurschulen which were vocational schools. The upgrading to Fachhochschulen favoured a tendency to "academization" of the curricula and led to the requirement of a longer previous secondary schooling. Their creation, therefore, meant not a stronger labour market orientation of post-secondary education but a higher prestige for the vocationally oriented sector in the system. An assimilation of the Fachhochschulen to the universities, for prestige reasons, would make upgrading, which as such may be a healthy process, problematic. The Dutch Government wants the more specifically labour market oriented college sector to become the growth sector of higher education and wishes to stimulate, by the University Reform Act 1975, more professionally oriented university courses. As in some other countries, the preference of the Dutch Government for shorter, vocationally oriented courses seems not purely prompted by educational or labour market considerations, but probably as well by financial motives. The risk is that the justified preference for short-cycle, labour market oriented programmes may vary with the situation of governments' budgets, and in any case, that the length of programmes draws more attention than their content and orientation.

France has not only established Instituts Universitaires de Technologie to train senior technicians and middle level managers, but has also stimulated a stronger professional orientation in university programmes, particularly in those for the licence degree (3 years). In Switzerland vocationally oriented colleges enrol, as in the other countries, a considerable proportion of students in tertiary education. In most countries there is an awareness that post-experience courses will become an important part of educational offerings. Increasingly, adults will become the regular clientele of tertiary education, to improve their knowledge and skills through supplementary programmes and refresher courses. This type of adult education is recognised in the Swedish recurrent education policy. In reform acts of the Federal Republic of Germany and of the Netherlands the Kontaktstudium and het post-academisch onderwijs respectively are explicitly mentioned as functions of the universities. In the United Kingdom universities and colleges have a traditional interest in adult education. In 1972-73 more than 150,000 students were enrolled in university sponsored adult education in England and Wales to which number more than 36,000 enrolments, in that year, in the Open University had to be added (1).

---

(1) J Hecquet. Recent student flows in higher education. A report of the Institute of Education of the European Cultural Foundation, 1976, p.78.

It is the Working Party's conviction that all tertiary education institutions without neglecting other goals of education, should plan their undergraduate and graduate programmes with the needs of the labour market in mind, and not ignore the labour market positions which their students will have to fulfill. In this respect it is noteworthy that, although professionally oriented courses are stressed, in most countries no formal mechanisms have been developed to channel information from the labour market to educational institutions. It may be true that a significant number of teachers are in contact with government, industry, health care etc. and are well informed as to labour market developments; nevertheless a professional and vocational orientation of tertiary education has to be based on systematic qualitative and quantitative information concerning labour market developments. Such an information agency should be part of the tertiary education system.

In Sweden programme committees were established in 1977 for sectors of higher education. In these committees experts from the labour market are represented. Recently the Federal Republic of Germany has its Studienreform Kommissionen in which labour market representatives also take part.

Although tertiary education institutions will have to play an increasingly important role in post-experience and, more generally, in adult education, the nature of this role deserves more consideration. For governments and institutions it seems obvious that tertiary education institutions themselves will offer courses to new student categories. This need not always, however, be the most appropriate policy. These institutions might also serve as supporting agencies for firms, government and trade unions which themselves offer the courses. Tertiary education institutions may, then, do research to develop the courses and design them.

Research

A second goal, acknowledged in governments' policies, is the advancement of knowledge. Usually, in reform plans it is stressed that all tertiary education ought to be, in some way, connected with research. In the United Kingdom research is not the prerogative of universities: polytechnics are increasingly involved. In Sweden, according to the Reform Act, interaction is to be established between basic (= undergraduate) studies and research throughout the whole of the Högskola. The regional college boards in Norway, governing the newly established regional colleges, have, among others, to co-ordinate research, whereas in the German Hochschulrahmengesetz 1976 the function of research is attributed to all Hochschulen, which comprise both traditional universities and the more recent Pädagogische Hochschulen and Fachhochschulen. These latter institutions have a more restricted research assignment.

Research is a word ambiguously used, probably because research talent is scarce, but doing research has a high prestige. This tension has led to an inflated meaning of the word research.

In governments' policies with regard to tertiary education the assignment of the research function to institutions and of research duties to staff is not the clearest part. Pressure of institutions and of teachers' interest groups may partly be responsible for this. Both non-university teachers and non-university institutions strive often after such assignments and the universities themselves are very reluctant to consider any reorganisation which might lead to a more differentiated assignment of research duties to their staff.

Both from the angle of educational policy and from that of research policy a careful definition is needed of what is understood by research. In its strict sense, the word is referring to an endeavour primarily aiming at advancing the state of knowledge by theoretical and experimental/empirical contributions. If this endeavour is successful, it usually leads to communication, mostly through a publication, to the scholarly community. Research in this sense requires high, mostly specialised expertise, and a creative mind.

As a matter of fact, many university teachers who are supposed to do research, never or rarely communicate research findings. Many others publish now and then, but the value of their contributions is rather low. Only a rather small group contributes significantly.

The question is whether this situation, from an educational point of view, must be regarded as negative. Is the unity of teaching and research, in the strict sense, indispensable for universities ? Certainly, universities must be attractive for a great number of the best scholars to make sure that the most recent knowledge is taught, to create a climate of intellectual vitality and critical thought. Such scholars will only be willing to work in a university if they have the opportunity to do research. If not, either they will prefer another career, or their talents will not be fully used. But it can hardly be expected that the ten thousands of university teachers in a country are all scholars of this kind. Most of them are good teachers, but not creative researchers. What they need is sufficient time and facilities, and a stimulating climate, to keep pace with the advancements in their subject. Correspondingly, most of the university

teachers' research is really critical reading of the contributions of genuine researchers. From this, the way to genuine research goes through commenting upon and systematising other scholars' original contributions. Most courses in the first years of university education may very well be taught by teachers of the last type. It might even be advantageous that such teachers would concentrate on teaching and on the therefore necessary study instead of spreading their time, energy and ambitions on both teaching and research (1). From the angle of research policy the advantage would be that resources would be better used.

What applies to teachers, applies even more to students. The unity of learning and research is still more a myth than the unity of teaching and research. Students can only participate in genuine research in the fourth or fifth course year. And many students never participate in it. Again this is not a matter for regret, in view of the ambitions and talents of students and of what they need in their future careers.

Research assignments and resources should therefore not spread still further, without due consideration, to other institutions of tertiary education and to their teachers. There may, however, be good reasons to give restricted research assignments to some of these institutions. Equally it may be recommendable, from the angle of research policy, to allocate research facilities to individual teachers in these institutions who have proved their research capabilities.

From the angle of educational policy there are two main reasons to preserve an important research domain in tertiary education : genuine researchers are needed to keep teaching, where appropriate, in contact with the frontiers of knowledge, and to educate future researchers, one of the tasks of tertiary education.

Also the advancement of knowledge, a goal of research policy, is served by the participation of educational institutions and teachers in research. Important human resources would otherwise remain untapped; it is important to have research also done in institutions which, by their autonomy, can protect research against interference; and some fields of research would easily disappear if they were not connected with education, in particular those fields which do not promise a directly usable output.

---

(1) Consequently, it would be necessary to base promotions also on teaching performance.

The working party has observed that the share of university research (including the research of university teachers outside the universities) in the total research activities of the seven countries is quantitatively very important. To its view this share has to be preserved and the quality has to be improved. Now that innovation is considered to be crucial to stagnating economies, the role of universities in contract research or the participation of university teachers in outside research may even increase. An increasing role of research to solve the community's urgent problems and to contribute to its welfare has however to be kept under proper control to guarantee that it will not impair the teaching function of the university and its specific contributions to the advancement of knowledge.

The arguments in favour of an important research contribution of tertiary education do not imply that all research in which teachers are involved has to be done within the organisational framework set up for teaching. Depending on the field of research there may be strong arguments to organise research separately within educational institutions or to establish research centres within the sector of tertiary education in which teachers would do their research. It is even in line with the arguments given to appoint teachers for part of their working time in independent or other research centres outside tertiary education, provided that this is part of a deliberate policy.

It is the working party's conviction that the research function of the universities and, possibly, of other tertiary education institutions, can only be preserved if, within the framework of a deliberate educational and research policy, research assignments and research resources are carefully attributed to those units of educational institutions and to those teachers whose teaching must be combined with research and/or who are capable of contributing significantly to the advancement of knowledge.

The cultural and community function.

The universities in particular have always been regarded as institutions which transmit the cultural heritage. In our dynamic societies not only the transmission, but also the creation of culture is important. Not only elites but also the masses influence the main stream of culture; influences come from all sides. Tertiary education has, therefore, in our societies the increasingly important function of critically scrutinising values, norms, expressions, and of helping youngsters and adults to grow into self-aware and independent individuals who may contribute to the cultural development of their societies.

Further, power is increasingly exercised, by their participation in organisations and informal groups, by people of different educational backgrounds and different social classes. Democratic participation increases, not only in the political arena, but also in economic organisations and welfare institutions. To perform these new roles in a responsible way, more education is often needed. Tertiary education has to prepare not only for roles in the labour market, but equally for the many roles of adults in public life. The increasing democratisation of our societies which at the same time are facing problems of growing complexity, demands a high level of education of the citizenry as a whole.

The growing concern for adult education is in line with these new educational needs, at least if adult education is not restricted to professional or vocational post-experience courses. It is not clear, however, for most countries that in tertiary education policy this third goal has a distinctive place.

Personal growth.

The three goals dealt with so far have a specifically social dimension: the benefits to the community, in material and non-material terms, are to the fore. In our democratic societies, the individual has, however, certain rights, including rights to education. Personal growth as a goal of education has, therefore, a firm place in traditional views on education.

Particularly in universities, personal growth is often considered to be more important as a goal than the needs of careers. Or the opinion is that the first goal is serving at the same time the second one. At least implicitly the expansion of study places, even if this seems to run counter to the labour market prospects, is based on the opinion that education has also to serve the goal of personal fulfilment.

Implications for policy.

These four goals are not new as such, but they have, due to developments in our societies, new implications. These implications, for the content of programmes and for the composition and size of the student population, need to be spelled out. The implicit contents of these goals must be disclosed by comparing them with actual and aspired developments in society. Then, a variety of programmes and courses, for a large part of youth and of the adult population, are seen to correspond with them.

Although all four goals may be served by a particular programme, and students may be motivated by each of them, they need to be distinguished clearly for policy reasons as the following examples may demonstrate.

Because of actual or expected financial constraints individual demand cannot have highest priority under all circumstances. In recent years most countries have experienced numerus clausus in some fields of study. In a system of mass tertiary education governments will continually be confronted with the question for which fields of study will individual demand be decisive of the number of study places, and for which programmes estimated labour market needs, and costs, are the most important criteria. The extent to which each of the four goals is served by a particular programme may then be taken into account. Different hierarchies of goals to which programmes are oriented may also lead to different admission, selection and examination policies. When a high level of professional performance is of great importance to society, a high minimum standard of achievement is more appropriate for admission and selection than if programmes are primarily serving personal growth.

Clearly distinguished and spelled out goals of tertiary education are a necessary basis for policy, and more particularly for a policy of diversification. Policies of governments are not sophisticated in this respect.

The working party recommends :

- that governments explicitly accept as goals of their tertiary education policy : preparation for the labour market, the advancement of knowledge, the furthering of cultural life and participation in all sectors of public life and personal growth. A balanced orientation towards these goals can in many fields of study be achieved by programmes of a broad and fundamental character in the initial stage of tertiary education. On the other hand, specific and very practical programmes may be more appropriate for some types of youngsters, also from the point of view of personal growth.

- Governments should use deliberately the four goals for a policy of diversification with respect to content of programmes, admission and selection, degree requirements, types of students to be served, priorities in expansion and decisions on quantitative planning.

- Governments and other agencies in charge of science and research policy should strengthen the research function in tertiary education by a careful assignment of research functions to institutions and of research duties to teachers, and by a corresponding allocation of resources. The organisational settings of research should be reconsidered both from the angle of educational policy and science and research policy.

- Governments should promote the creation of channels of information between the educational sector and other sectors of society to enable educational institutions to adapt their programmes to what society and individuals need.

- Tertiary education institutions, as stores of educational experience and centres of knowledge, should not only orient themselves towards individuals (students), but also enable institutions outside the field of education to take part in activities of recurrent education and to be innovative.

4. Access to tertiary education

In all the seven countries it is part of governments' policy to meet the expectation of individuals that they may participate in tertiary educational programmes appropriate to them. On the one hand these expectations are widened by a policy to increase equal educational opportunity, on the other hand numerus clausus measures are frustrating there expectations with regard to certain fields of study.

4.1 Equal educational opportunity

All countries regard it essential that educational policy should contribute to greater equality of educational opportunity. As to sex an unequal participation is still observed, although countries vary in this respect. Traditional views on man's and woman's role in the labour market and, more generally, in society influence not only enrolment figures as a whole, but also the field of study. Particularly the humanities and education attract females, whereas science and technology remain, typically, fields of study for males.

Recent figures on enrolments by social class are scarce, but inequality of opportunity between social classes undoubtedly continues to exist.

More recently, the educational gap between generations has begun to draw the attention of policy makers. Reduction of this gap is one of the objectives of the Swedish policy of recurrent education, of the British Open University, and of existing or proposed distance teaching systems in the Federal Republic, France and the Netherlands.

These three types of educational inequalities are most likely to be reduced by admission rules which no longer exclusively refer to secondary school certificates. Examples are the rule that people over 25 years can be admitted to universities (Sweden, Netherlands), and the open access policy of the British Open University as far as previous schooling is concerned.

Not only sex, social class and age are related to unequal educational opportunity. The geographical distribution of educational facilities also deserves attention. An equal distribution has been part of policy in all countries. The federal structure of Germany and Switzerland creates particular problems in this respect which have, however, been solved by common planning between the Federal and Länder, and Kanton authorities respectively.

Equality of educational opportunity cannot mean that, ultimately, all people will achieve equally. Whatever is the precise influence of social factors on school performance and school career, they are not the only factors. The concept of equal educational opportunity comprises the following elements :

1. People with the same hereditary intelligence should not have an unequal chance to develop this intelligence due to non-hereditary factors which we can prevent without curtailing legitimate freedom. Most of the measures to achieve this equality have to be taken below the level of tertiary education and many of them are not part of educational policy.

   Where adults have not had this equal opportunity tertiary education has, however, an important function. The most appropriate measure is to develop (more) open admission systems, such as that of the British Open University, the new Swedish admission system and the Dutch policy for people over 25 years old. In France the Conservatoire National des Arts et Métiers (CNAM) was the first important initiative, followed by the universities of Vincennes, Lille and Paris VII. In Switzerland the university of Geneva has introduced a broader admission policy.

2. A second and - chronologically speaking - the oldest meaning of equal educational opportunity is, that there should be no financial barriers to tertiary education for people meeting the admission rules. In all seven countries financial aid systems have been developed to achieve this aim.

3. With respect to the development of a diversified mass tertiary education system a new meaning will rapidly grow in importance : a fair distribution of resources to meet all kinds of adults' educational needs. This meaning is produced by the development of a system of higher education, based originally on class privileges and after that on its importance for economic growth, into a welfare provision for a great part of the population. In relation to this development more and more it will be stressed that equality of educational opportunity does not only refer to equality of access to a rather narrowly defined domain of education, but also to the provision of educational facilities to serve very different abilities and interests.

If resources are insufficient to meet all legitimate needs, a fair distribution may require a numerus clausus. To achieve a fair distribution attention should not only be paid to traditional student categories, youngsters with secondary school education, but also to adults. Furthermore study places should not only be expanded in existing undergraduate and graduate programmes, but also in post-experience courses and in adult education serving other than labour market goals.

The system of quantitative planning, decided upon by the Swedish Parliament in 1977, may be a useful instrument to achieve such a fair distribution of resources. In the United Kingdom the system of admission allows, in principle, individual institutions to control the distribution of resources, and the University Grants Committee could be used for this purpose, although this would run counter to the British idea of university autonomy. Also the newly established Regional Advisory Committees (RAC's) could be developed into a steering mechanism for the non-university sector.

In most continental countries <u>legal</u> provisions would have to be altered to allow quantitative planning by the government, such an alteration is, at present, not a matter to be considered.

4. The extent to which equality of educational opportunity is achieved also depends on admission rules and selection procedures. Usual admission rules have a predictive nature. This applies to entrance examinations as well as to school leaving certificates. Previous performance is the basis for predicting future performance. Such prediction leads to two types of mistake : applicants are admitted who will fail and applicants are refused who would have performed well if they had been admitted. It is the latter mistake which affects equality of opportunity. By the conventional admission rules an - unknown - number of people do not get the chance to prove that they can accomplish a certain programme.

Open admission would, therefore, serve the ideal of equal opportunity. Applied to present educational systems such an admission policy might however affect seriously the quality and efficiency of tertiary education. Therefore it is understandable that admission rules have been broadened in the last twenty years but have never been abandoned. It may, however, be worthwhile to explore under what conditions and to what extent predictive selection procedures may give way to a more open admission. We shall return to this subject in section 6.

4.2 Numerus clausus.

Some countries, because of actual or expected financial constraints, have concluded that individual demand cannot have highest priority under all circumstances. They have not expanded study places in all fields to meet the number of qualified applicants.

In the United Kingdom the considerations behind this policy of restriction are more or less hidden by the fact that traditionally secondary school certificates do not grant automatically right of access to specific tertiary education programmes and institutions. Institutions select from among qualified school leavers according to their examination results. The problem of numerus clausus, therefore, does not pose itself so dramatically as in other countries. Although the overall number of candidates does not exceed the number of places, there is an unbalance for specific programmes. In other Western Europe countries the right of access was traditionally acquired by successful completion of certain types of secondary education. This has changed to a certain extent.

Sweden has changed its policy of free access, as a consequence of the wish to have a planned allocation of resources and to steer the educational system. Planning and steering imply that various policy goals have to be taken into consideration.

In the Netherlands, Norway and the Federal Republic of Germany access to a number of university programmes has been restricted for several years, and also in France problems of teaching and training capacity are observed in the fields of medicine and pharmacy.

Also in these countries vocational colleges have always known restricted admission. Now that these colleges are becoming part of an integrated system, together with the universities, the question forces itself more expressly why there should be a different admission policy. More fundamentally, admission policy will have to be reconsidered because in a fully developed system of mass tertiary education the demand for education may go beyond the point of economic benefits and surpass the resources society has available for education. Admission policy will then have to be worked out for categories of programmes differing as to their main goal and as to costs. As has been said in the preceding section, the numerus clausus problem is very likely inherent in a system of mass tertiary education and must be looked upon from the angle of a fair distribution of educational resources. Institutions may or may not decide themselves how many students they will enrol for specific programmes, the point is whether the government will afford sufficient resources to meet the demand assuming that these resources are efficiently used by the institutions. If it can be foreseen that this cannot be done for all programmes, a fair solution can only be attained by a deliberate numerus clausus policy.

Sweden and Norway have gone farthest in opting for such a policy. In the other countries which are already facing an imbalance between the number of candidates for specific programmes and the number of available places, the numerus clausus is dealt with by a rather ad-hoc policy. Till now Switzerland did not have to cope with this imbalance, but it may very soon appear in the fields of medicine and psychology.

The working party recommends :

- that governments in executing a policy of equal educational opportunity explore systematically the possibilities of broader admission rules.

- Governments should procure the legal possibilities, the information and instruments to achieve a fair distribution of educational provisions for the whole population.

- Governments should, more specifically, develop a deliberate policy with regard to quantitative planning.

5. The effectiveness and efficiency of tertiary education

Effectiveness is understood as the extent to which goals are attained. It may be measured by comparing the outcome of an activity with predetermined goals, or by comparing the outcomes of different institutions or systems. Efficiency is defined as the input-output ratio. Input may be regarded as financial resources, human energy and skills; output as the proportion of freshmen who succeed and the length of time they need to obtain a degree or diploma, the quality of the graduates, the quantity and quality of research findings.

The information available to the Working Party did not allow it to reach conclusions on the relative effectiveness and efficiency of the different tertiary education systems. Moreover, there is the question of how nigh a country wants to rank efficiency among its values. A strong selection of students may improve the efficiency of the system, but then a minor role has to be given to the value of equal educational opportunity. With due caut[illegible] the working party has looked into some rough indicators of efficiency.

5.1 Drop-out rates

Whether drop-out rates are meaningful indicators of efficiency depends on the intention of students to complete a full programme. In Sweden there seems to be a tendency in the last years to enrol at an older age for only part of a programme. Moreover, if students drop out, their partial education may justify the resources spent on them depending on the way the programme is built and on what the student has achieved. With these reservations it may however be said that present high drop-out rates indicate a lack of effectiveness and efficiency. The differences in rates between British and continental universities are then remarkable. It could be advanced that the lower drop-out in British universities is achieved by means of a higher input of teachers. And indeed the student-staff ratio in the UK is more favourable

than in the other countries (1), but in some cases only slightly. Another argument advanced is that British institutions select their students.

Both arguments may be valid, but what needs to be stressed is that British institutions traditionally see it as their obligation to let a whole class of students complete their programme at a predetermined date, whereas the relations between continental universities and their students are usually characterised by a lack of mutual commitment. For a better use of resources and for a healthier climate for students it would be good to design both institutions' and governments' policies in continental countries deliberately from the point of view of how the teaching/learning situation can be shaped in such a way that non-intended drop-out can be reduced. We shall return to this subject in section 6.

5.2 Lengthy routes

In the Netherlands and the Federal Republic of Germany graduates of vocational colleges have access to related university departments (in Germany, in some cases also to other departments), but have then principally to start at the beginning (with few exceptions). Such lengthy routes in tertiary education have become very common because admission rules were broadened, whereas curricula were not co-ordinated. The respective governments are looking now for a solution. The German authorities originally favoured an integration of curricula while more emphasis is now being given to a new system of interrelated courses at the various levels. The Dutch Government favours a transfer to a corresponding programme either in the universities or in the vocational colleges after the first course year.

5.3 Length of courses, length of study

In great contrast are the first degree courses of usually 3 years duration in English universities, Swedish philosophical faculties and French universities (licence), and the 5 to 6 years first and final degree courses of German and Dutch universities. As to length of study the contrast becomes still greater because at least the English student normally completes his study after 3 years, whereas the average Dutch student needs about 7 1/2 years.

---

(1) OECD Towards mass higher education. Issues and dilemmas. Paris 1974, p.188.

The question arises of whether, as in other countries, a differentiation of university programmes into a shorter first terminal programme and an advanced second level programme would not serve the Netherlands and the Federal Republic better. The German Hochschulrahmengesetz has given an affirmative answer and the Dutch Reform Act moves in that direction too without, however, explicitly designing a second level degree programme. It is so far uncertain, however, how long Dutch university programmes will be in the future and whether university programmes will remain uniform irrespective of a future career in research or in the application of knowledge. In the Netherlands, as well as in the Federal Republic of Germany, governments want to shorten university programmes.

Length of actual study in the continental countries usually exceeds length of courses. From an individual's point of view this does not necessarily mean a waste of time. It leads, however, to an increased burden on society's resources if financing is related to enrolled students, not merely to students actually being taught, and if students or their parents benefit from loans, grants, tax reductions and other facilities.

The working party recommends :

- that governments and institutions clearly define criteria of effectiveness, such as maximally acceptable proportions of drop-outs, acceptable length of study, minimum levels of performance of students, desired research activities, and that they direct their policies towards meeting these criteria.

- Governments and institutions should establish criteria of efficiency, and more particularly they should pay attention to a balanced allocation of time for teaching, research and administration, to the evaluation of different methods of teaching both from the point of view of effectiveness and efficiency , to a lowering of drop-out rates, to a reasonable relation between length of study time and length of courses and to research productivity of teachers.

- Governments should increase efficiency in the institutions by furthering a democratic governance system which allows the functioning of competent administrators and they should increase cost consciousness by finance systems which allow an efficient use of resources while taking into account both the principle of self-administration and the rule of accountability for public funds.

- Governments and institutions should prevent unnecessarily lengthy routes through tertiary education by co-ordination of programmes and by a system of credit points (exemptions).

- Governments and institutions should design, where possible, their longer programmes as a series of short, complete, programmes, to reduce drop-outs and to shorten length of study.

- Governments and institutions should pay great attention to the counselling of students before and during their study.

## 6. Components of mass tertiary education

### 6.1 The student body

From the preceding sections it follows that the age composition of the student body is expected to change in favour of adults. This means that the facilities for part-time education have to be increased because the possibilities for educational leave are likely to be too restricted to meet educational demands. Part-time education will become the more important if recurrent education policy also induces a considerable proportion of secondary school leavers to postpone participation in tertiary education.

The reasons for favouring such a postponement are :

- learning can benefit from experience;

- individuals will, after some experience in adult roles, better be able to judge what type of education, to what extent, will be most appropriate for them. Education will then meet felt needs and this will improve motivation. On the other hand the problems also need to be recognised. Necessary secondary school knowledge may have disappeared, and the economic costs of postponement may exceed those of direct continuation of education under certain conditions (1). Although it is quite uncertain what the proportions of different student categories in the future will be, we can be sure that tertiary education will have to adapt itself to the needs, characteristics, life and working situations of the following groups :

---

(1) See for this subject V Stoikov. The economics of recurrent education and training. International Labour Office, Geneva, 1975.

| Categories | Programmes/Courses |
|---|---|
| 1. Secondary school leavers embarking on full-time study.<br>2. Secondary school leavers entering the labour market, and wishing to study part-time. | Programmes which, to a varying degree, are oriented to the working role, other adult roles and personal interests. |
| 3. Adults in the labour force wanting to study either part-time or full-time for shorter or longer periods.<br>4. Other adults, wishing to join the labour force or not. | Programmes for a new career.<br>Programmes to increase expertise for present career.<br>Programmes to get on in present career.<br>Personal interest courses.<br>Courses to enable expert participation in community affairs and to promote the cultural level of the community. |

It is true that not all of the members of a specific category share the same circumstances. Some working adults may be able to participate in full-time education, others may not. Equally it must be stressed that a particular programme or course may serve different purposes. A course may be a component of undergraduate tertiary education and at the same time be used as a refresher course or to prepare for a new career, it may serve personal interests as well as prepare for the labour market, or be used for activities outside one's job. Many of the students concerned are now served by institutions which do not belong to the sector of education in the formal sense. It is not the view of the working party that the tasks of these institutions should be taken over by universities or colleges. We wish only to stress that they have to be integrated in tertiary education policy and that universities and colleges should feel responsible for those fields of adult education for which they are best suited and, if necessary, support other institutions and organisations. Because of the vast scale of the domain of adult education, the working party only paid attention to adult education schemes in institutions of higher education. In most countries these schemes are scarce.

6.2 Organisational dimensions of time and space

From the description of the potential student body it follows that part-time education has to be an important component of tertiary education. Particularly in most continental universities a considerable proportion of part-time or full-time working students are often enrolled in full-time courses. They should not be refused unless the effectiveness and efficiency of the institutions' teaching is seriously affected. A lot of present part-time students may however prefer facilities that are geared to their situation and many adults will only get an opportunity for more education if such facilities are created.

Part-time education is particularly developed in the United Kingdom and in the Netherlands in various fields of non-university education. In France, universities are, to an increasing degree, offering their courses in the afternoon and in the evening. Most part-time education consists of day-time programmes, taught by conventional classroom methods and therefore requiring classroom attendance. The differences between full and part-time education are then mainly : a smaller number of classroom meetings, held on only some working days, on evenings or on Saturdays.

The Working Party regards the development of distance teaching systems in various countries as one of the very important diversification measures. In its view the words independent study systems stress still better the fundamental idea behind these developments. Central is the idea that there is a need to foster independent study which frees the student from specific time and space bonds and allows tertiary education to be expanded without huge investments.

As an aid to independent study different learning facilities may be provided. The earliest, most obvious, and as a rule most appropriate form of assistance consists of written materials, in correspondence courses. The British Open University has developed this method to an advanced stage. Course teams, in which not only subject experts, but also educational and media experts are involved, have developed courses of high quality of which written materials are the core. The correspondence course may be supported in various ways : by tutorials, "self-help groups" of students, by telephone contact with teachers, by television and radio, by cassettes and discs, audio as well as video. The Open University has demonstrated that even home laboratory work is possible with the aid of specially designed home kits.

All these technologies have their special educational advantages and disadvantages, and costs may vary greatly. Television and radio transmission time is usually very restricted, which, in the near future, will be a constraint on its use on a large scale. Video discs and video cassettes may become, on various points, a better alternative in the eighties, but the aggregate costs will probably be higher than those of broadcast transmission. In both cases the production costs will be roughly the same, but distribution costs of non-broadcasting systems are higher. The most appropriate contribution of media will depend on the characteristics of the target groups, the content of courses, the size and density of the population and the geography of the country.

Problematical aspects of distance teaching systems as represented by the British Open University are first of all that written materials are probably not the best kind of help for those students who have a rather limited educational experience. Moreover writing essays is certainly one of the more difficult parts of an examination procedure, which means that students of the Open University to a certain extent have to face higher demands than ordinary students. Further it must be observed that producers of written materials have a powerful position, because students do not have the chance to criticise their ideas in a face-to-face contact. This situation may be exploited for a one-sided exposure of students to scientific approaches, to values and opinions.

Independent study systems are now functioning, or being developed, in all countries, except Switzerland. In addition to the United Kingdom, the Federal Republic of Germany has, since 1975, the Fernuniversität in Hagen, in the Land North Rhine Westphalia, which has been based until now on correspondence courses, audio and video cassettes and regional study centres. Earlier the Quadriga Funkkolleg was set up at university level. In France, the Conservatoire National des Arts et Metiers (CNAM) uses television in its part-time courses. Since the sixties, universities - seventeen in 1975 - are offering radio and television courses, partly supplemented by written materials (Télé-enseignement universitaire). The Dutch Government has set up a planning committee to prepare an open university, which will offer university - and college - level programmes. Sweden has various projects in which different forms of organisation and teaching methods are used : television and radio, supplemented by written materials, correspondence courses supported by a few hours of teacher-student contact, study groups provided with self-instruction materials and coached by teachers. Universities are involved in these projects. Finally Norway has created the Norwegian Institute of Distant Education at Oslo, which until now is offering only courses at the level of compulsory education.

6.3 Curricular patterns

Long and short courses

In some countries most first degree university programmes are long. This was not a serious problem as long as universities were institutions for a very tiny minority. Since the massive enrolments in the sixties problems have been growing. There is first the financial problem : a university graduate costs a lot. Then there is the question of whether these long, theoretical, discipline oriented programmes are appropriate both with respect to labour market preparation and to personal growth of the increasing number of students. Educational and labour market considerations, at that time more than financial problems, have, since the end of the sixties, prompted governments to stimulate the development of short-cycle programmes. In the Federal Republic of Germany and the Netherlands more importance was attributed to the already existing vocational college sector, in France the IUT's were established, in Norway the regional colleges. Also in Sweden new short programmes were developed (YTH-programmes). The policy question is how to make these short cycle programmes attractive by their quality and, still more, by their career prospects. The longer university programmes have, usually, more prestige and, at least till now, better career prospects were related to them.

Different solutions are chosen to integrate short cycle programmes into a system of tertiary education, but it is clear that there is no one best solution. If we take as criteria of success that a large proportion of students apply for short cycle programmes and do not transfer, after graduation, to long cycle programmes, then the Norwegian solution has been successful. In France, the IUT's seem to be rather attractive for applicants, but the transfer rate to longer university programmes is rather high. Also in Germany and the Netherlands the Fachhochschulen, and the vocational colleges respectively are partly used as transfer institutions to the universities.

High transfer rates can however also be looked upon from another angle. Short, vocational courses attract workers' children often more easily than universities. If gifted workers' children afterwards transfer, this has to be judged positively.

In the Federal Republic of Germany the LÄnder upgraded vocational colleges to PÄdagogische Hochschulen and Fachhochschulen. A second step was the policy to integrate all higher education programmes into a comprehensive university. It has been proved, however, to be very difficult to include the existing universities in this policy. A similar policy is being developed in Sweden.

What solution has the best chance, either to add short cycle institutions to the existing pattern or to integrate short cycle programmes into existing institutions, is difficult to say. The obvious advantage of the Norwegian and French solution is their incremental nature. One has not to change existing situations, something new is added which in the long run will lead to a different system. Success is then dependent on how society, including employers, parents and students, value the new courses. This, again, depends on a variety of social and economic developments, which influence prospects for graduates.

If this line of reform is chosen it may contribute to its success to facilitate transfer at least after the end of the programme. But care should be taken to avoid a situation where students transferring to a longer course in the same field cannot use most of the units of their former programmes.

The achievement of easy transfer and efficient routes through higher education programmes in the same field is obviously facilitated by bringing them together into one institution. This can be done in two alternative ways : a first programme of say three years is followed by a second cycle of higher level programmes, or students follow the same courses in an orientation period and spread themselves then gradually in longer and shorter programmes.

This policy means however a fundamental reform of large parts of the system. It demands the design of fully new programmes for large parts of higher education, and an integration of programmes in the same field usually requires mergers of institutions, sometimes new building programmes, a reorganisation of the organisational structure of institutions, new staff structures and working conditions, and, most difficult of all, a new orientation for many teachers. Such a policy must necessarily be a very long term policy.

The central problem behind these reforms is how to design curricular patterns in such a way that students will find, without much loss of time, an available programme for which they are capable and motivated. For such a design the following criteria are important, apart from the obvious criterion that the quality of educational experience has to be high.

1. Maximum opportunity for the individual

As the introduction of broader admission rules often demonstrates, a lot of people excluded by the previously existing rules have the ability to perform at the required level. As has been said earlier, the rule of open access would give everybody who wants to do so the opportunity to demonstrate his ability. Such a rule would however imply large modifications of the educational system and would, in present systems, often affect effectiveness and efficiency to an unacceptable extent. It would however go a long way to an open access policy, if the admission rule would be that over a minimum age only evidence is necessary of the minimum knowledge and skills which are specifically assumed by the programme opted for. For a course in economics this minimum knowledge may consist of specified knowledge of mathematics and of the language(s) in which the important contributions are written. Swedish admission policy is going now in that direction. A few general qualification requirements, however, must be met by everybody, independent of the study course intended (1).

This policy is radical, compared with present traditions, but would be more efficient, if carefully executed, then present regulations sometimes are.

2. Early evaluation

If the above rule is applied, a proportion of the admitted students will not prove able to perform within the time period and at the minimum level required by the educational authorities (government and/or institutions). This risk has to be taken if individual opportunity is highly valued, because we do not know which individuals will fail. In applying the first rule society gives applicants the opportunity to prove their ability, but on the other hand a waste of resources must be prevented. This leads to the principle of early evaluation. Curriculum design and assessment procedures must allow both the student and the institution to decide at an early stage whether the choice of programme has been right.

3. No study-time lost

If students fail to achieve the learning objectives of the programme chosen, they have already spent some time, probably a year, in the programme. It would be a loss of time for many students, under a broad admission policy, if they could not complete a meaningful study of which their previous courses are a part. The design of programmes should give this opportunity (eg self-contained units of study).

---

(1) See the Swedish Case Study, prepared by Lennart Sandgren.

4. Priority of education to selection

Not selection but education is the core function of educational institutions. Therefore, selection decisions shall be taken only on a few occasions in a whole (series of) programme(s). If the student has been accepted, after an evaluation of his achievements, then the institution must take the responsibility that the student completes the programme. On the other hand, the student has to comply with the regulations the institution regards as necessary to bear its responsibility. The fundamental idea of educational policy has to be that institutions have to decide at an early stage whether they can take the responsibility for the education of a student, given the degree requirements, their resources and the performance of the student, that they are accepting that responsibility by letting the student pass the evaluation tests and that then they have to fulfil that responsibility, provided that the student co-operates.

Different solutions

The criteria of early evaluation and no loss of study time have to guarantee efficiency in a mass tertiary education system in which the rule of maximal opportunity for the individual is applied. Different solutions are, then, possible in which the four rules, in varying degrees, are applied.

A parallel system of long and shorter first and final degree programmes

The present Dutch system is an example of long university programmes (5-6 years) and, parallel to them in many fields of study, 3 year vocational programmes to which a fourth year of practical work may be added (then usually the third course year). Such a system can reasonably work under either the first or the second of the following assumptions. The first assumption is that admission requirements for university and college programmes are so strict that institutions only admit students who will prove to be capable to perform at the required level. Institutions may accept the responsibility for them at admission. The system will be efficient and effective, but one rule is not applied, that of maximal individual opportunity. Many applicants will be rejected by the admission procedure, although they would prove capable if admitted.

The second assumption is that admission is rather open and that evaluation takes place in the first year. Students who fail, would then have to transfer from the university to a college or from a college to a less demanding programme. Students would not be allowed a second transfer, neither during the programme nor after graduation, and the institution would feel responsible for the student's success after his transfer. In such a system the individual has had the opportunity to prove his ability and the loss of study time is maximally one year.

Neither the first nor the second assumption is realised in the present Dutch system. Admission requirements correspond with the second assumption, but there is no well developed, early and definite evaluation procedure in the universities. Although usually there is a preliminary examination after the first year, participation within a certain time period is not compulsory, the examination can always be repeated, and transfer is possible, any time, to all programmes for which the student has the necessary secondary school certificate. Loss of time may amount to several years. The inefficiency of the system is increased by the admission rule that a vocational college certificate gives right of access to a related university programme if the holder does not have the secondary school certificate required for admission to a university. Because university and college programmes are not co-ordinated, a college graduate spends minimally 8-9 years in higher education before getting his university degree.

The University Reform Act 1975 limits the whole period of enrolment for university first degree programmes to the official length of the programme plus two years, and the enrolment period for the preliminary examination to the length of the related courses plus one year. However the right to sit for examinations is not restricted to enrolled students.

A sequence pattern of university programmes

The French university system is the most elaborate example of a sequence pattern of programmes : three cycles, and in the second cycle the 3 years programme for the licence and the 4 years programme for the maîtrise. In this system a broad admission can be accompanied by a rather high degree of effectiveness and efficiency under the following assumptions :

- the first cycle is not too long and is both a transfer programme to the second cycle and a terminal programme for the labour market;

- successive cycles demand increasingly higher intellectual or other abilities;

- to gain access to the next cycle higher achievements are demanded than to obtain a diploma for the programme completed.

If these assumptions are embodied in the system and if institutions feel responsible for their students, equal educational opportunity, effectiveness and efficiency can all be realised to a great extent. Such a system demands, however, carefully worked out curricula and strict control of internal processes. In this respect, French universities are rather deficient. Equally the idea that universities should feel responsible for accepted students is not part of their educational policy. Rates of drop-outs reach very high proportions, sometimes over 50 percent (1).

A system of consecutive university programmes will not, however, be sufficient to constitute a system of mass tertiary education. On first cycle level more differentiation will be needed than can be provided in a first university cycle. Because future researchers and other advanced specialists also have to go through it, the first university cycle has to be supplemented by less demanding programmes. This is not what is observed in the French system. The selective grandes écoles are elite institutions of higher prestige than the universities. The IUT's, equally selective, are clearly not selecting students of less ability than the universities. ".... the overall data do lend some support to the thesis that the IUT students are in general more academically able than their brethren elsewhere in the university..... It appears, then, that the IUT's tend to recruit the less able bacheliers from the upper classes and the most able students from the lower classes" (2). Only the higher technical sections of the technical lycées (brevet de technicien supérieur) are below the university level.

---

(1) John H van de Graaff. The Politics of Innovation in French Higher Education : the University Institute of Technology in Higher Education, Vol.5, nr. 2, 1976, p.191.

(2) de Graaff, o.c., p.197.

The question may be raised of whether the burden of mass education has not been laid too exclusively, in France, on universities. It might be desirable to attract more students from the universities to other programmes, clearly differentiated from the first cycle university programmes by their more vocational nature and appropriate for less academically gifted students. If the point of gravity would shift to such programmes, the French system would evolve towards the system described in the next section.

A parallel system of first degree programmes, different as to purpose and levels, combined with a sequence pattern of programmes (usually in the universities).

The American system is an example of this system that has to be regarded as one of the more appropriate systems of mass tertiary education.

In Europe governments have been so concerned with the "noble and less noble institutions" dilemma, that too little stress has been laid on a policy of differentiation of first cycle programmes. The equivalence of university and non-university institutions and programmes has been stressed more than a clear differentiation of programmes as to purposes and levels. If such a policy of differentiation were to get more support, tertiary education systems would most easily evolve to a system of parallel first degree (or diploma) programmes, different as to purposes and levels, combined with a sequence pattern of programmes. To be effective and efficient and to maximise the individual's opportunity the following demands have then to be met :

- a rather broad admission policy has to be accompanied by an evaluation at an early stage;
- first degree programmes in the same field of study have to be co-ordinated to facilitate transfer after the evaluation;
- co-ordination must encourage transfer, after graduation in a short programme, to a long programme, and prevent the total length of study in tertiary education exceeding markedly the official length of the long programme.

Moreover the demands must be met which have been laid down in the preceding section for a sequence pattern of programmes.

A sequence pattern of programmes, in which all first degree programmes in the same field of study, or parts of them, have been integrated.

This system is one of the ideals of German reform policy, but to date hardly exists in its full sense. The Swedish policy also is moving in this direction where part of the programmes are concerned.

The problematic aspect of this model is its radical nature, which makes reform in this direction a difficult and risky undertaking. Moreover, the ideas behind this reform are, in Germany, linked with the policy of upgrading the vocational colleges. This may easily lead to greater homogenity of students instead of greater heterogenity of mass tertiary education. If it can be implemented, this model will be the best way of ensuring that students can find the study course most appropriate to them. It makes, however, very high demands on the design of curricula and on the control of educational and evaluation processes. Moreover the following requirements must be met for the system to work.

- The integrated curriculum must consist of lines of study which are different as to purposes and levels. Gradually the student must be helped to find the line of study most appropriate to him, on the basis of performance in preceding units of study.

- Length of study may not exceed markedly the official length of programmes; otherwise too many students will try the longer and more demanding study lines, which have usually been seen, until now, as the most promising lines.

In this model also the demands for a sequence pattern of programmes must be met.

The working party recommends :

- that governments promote part-time education, and, as a component of part-time education, independent study systems;

- that governments do not stimulate demand for tertiary education among school leavers but encourage, in the framework of recurrent education policy, programmes which correspond with the career needs of adults as well as with the needs of other adult roles and with personal interests;

- that governments design the future development of tertiary education systems with a balanced concern for equal educational opportunity, effectiveness and efficiency;

- that, in order to carry out the preceding recommendation, they foster differentiated but co-ordinated programmes on the first level of tertiary education, design long university programmes as a sequence of programmes and give priority to short-cycle programmes in creating new study places;

- that governments take measures to promote in institutions the ability and willingness to feel responsible for the success of the students they have accepted as capable students.

7. Tertiary education policy and the labour market

In none of the seven countries labour market prospects are taken as a guideline for overall tertiary education policy. This was quite understandable in the sixties, because in that period all kinds of higher education graduates were easily absorbed by the labour market. It is even understandable at present because the unemployment rates of these graduates are lower than the overall unemployment rate.

Still, the relation between tertiary education and the labour market is increasingly a matter of concern. And it can be observed that, notwithstanding expressed policy views, governments are not expanding study places in some expensive fields of study, such as medicine, to the extent which would meet increasing individual demand. As has been said earlier in this report, in a system of mass tertiary education, the individual demand for many programmes may surpass the number of corresponding jobs in the labour market and the resources society has available for education. Therefore, the relation between tertiary education policy and labour market policy needs to be clearly spelled out, if one wishes to avoid a more or less chaotic numerus clausus policy and an unequitable distribution of educational facilities.

7.1 Demand-supply adjustments (1)

How is the degree-holding labour force determined ? One theory is that changes in stocks of degree holders are ultimately explained by economic expansion and technical change, factors which produce differential growth rates of employment in

---

(1) See : Margaret S. Gordon (ed). Higher Education and the Labor Market, Mc.Graw Hill, 1974. (sponsored by the Carnegie Commission on Higher Education) and in this book more in particular D.L. Adkins. The American Educated Labor Force: An Empirical Look at Theories of its Formation and Composition; and L.C. Thurow. Measuring the Economic Benefits of Education.

the various sectors of the economy. Employers of growth sectors compete for the available supply of graduates by raising salaries and other job advantages and vice versa. The potential student is seen as calculating the costs and benefits of entering either a specific tertiary education programme or the labour market. According to this theory the demand for education is ultimately dependent on labour market prospects and, in the long run at least, there will be an equilibrium of demand for education and corresponding jobs.

According to a second theory, individuals, in their decisions to enrol, are not very wage sensitive. An increasing percentage of the population regards education as a consumer product and is influended in its decision to enrol mostly by social factors. In so far as people are influenced by economic considerations, they choose to get as much education as possible in order not to lose their competitive power in advance. In this respect people, in a system of mass tertiary education, are impelled to strive for diplomas and degrees, not so much to increase their career prospects as just not to get out of the running.

Also in this model long run unemployment does not occur. It is assumed that, due to tradition and power, earning differentials are maintained between people with different educational attainment levels regardless of their marginal productivity. As it is equally assumed that the expectations of graduates of tertiary education will adjust to new conditions no particular problems of motivation are expected. The question of what theory best fits empirical data cannot conclusively be answered. Still, the second theory seems to be more plausible.

In any case it would be a wise policy for governments not to rely on automatic and unproblematic adjustments of the labour market to the increasing educational attainment levels. Tertiary education policy and labour market policy cannot be pursued separately. Governments will have to decide what policy goals will have priority in general, and in which cases exceptions will have to be made to the general rule. Implicitly they have already decided to give priority to educational goals, but it remains unclear whether numerus clausus in certain fields has to be regarded as a consequence of exceptions to this general priority.

To pursue a balanced educational policy which is not interfering with policy goals in other domains, it will be necessary to be better informed about the factors which determine supply and demand of graduates.

7.2 Credentials and the labour market

One of the areas of investigation which needs attention as part of the supply and demand adjustment problem, is what mechanisms induce the correlation between education and earning power. R P Dore (1) lists these mechanisms as

- investment mechanisms which imply that schooling does transform people in some useful way;
- common-cause mechanisms, by which the correlation between educational attainment levels and incomes can be traced to a common cause of both; and
- institutional mechanisms, by which the correlation can be ascribed to certain established practices.

If education means an investment which makes people more productive in the economy, it would be useful to have more accurate knowledge of the nature of the investment needed for different jobs. To what extent is specific knowledge the best investment, to what extent is it not the actual content of learning which is important, but the powers of reasoning, the ability to handle abstractions, to collect data and to use them in checking propositions. Among the investments social attitudes may also be more or less important.

Insight into the most desirable type of investment may make it possible to design more appropriate programmes and it may help quantitative planning. For it may make a difference whether the educational investment is useful for a broader range of activities or only for a narrow field.

The assumption of the common cause mechanisms is that it is not the difference between educational attainment levels which accounts for income differences, but characteristics people already had before they obtained a diploma. As such characteristics are seen social class origins (hence different social connections and differently valued social attitudes and behaviour) and personal capacity (eg IQ, need for achievement). The extent to which this type of mechanism works in the labour market is significant in determining the success or otherwise of an equal educational opportunity policy.

---

(1) R P Dore. Human Capital Theory. The Diversity of Societies and the Problem of Quality in Education. In Higher Education 5(1976) 79 - 102.

For the adjustment of labour market policy to a system of mass tertiary education the extent to which institutional mechanisms are influential may be more important. The preceding mechanisms and the human capital theory assume an atomistic market economy. In fact, the labour market is determined to a high degree by rules developed by the bureaucracies of government and firms, negotiated by trade unions and established by law.

Due to the institutionalisation of the labour market, credentials are used to screen applicants. The justification for this screening on the basis of diplomas is that better educational records are expected to indicate better personal capacities and/or more desirable social attitudes. It takes less time to sort out applicants first of all on the basis of certificates. This way of screening may become the more common practice as the number of applicants grows. It has to be recognised here that, often, the appointment-making officials are not primarily interested in financial costs and benefits but want to avoid risks.

In rapidly changing societies rules which might have been rational in the past may become economically or socially disadvantageous. The linkage of salary scales with educational certificates may be quite rational as long as these certificates can reasonably be used as proxy measures of general ability. It may however lose its rationale in a system of mass tertiary education in which degree holders are very different in the required abilities, and in a modern society in which people can obtain knowledge and skills in many ways, also outside educational institutions. Another rule which may have to be reconsidered is that unemployed people do not have to accept jobs which are obviously below their educational attainment level. Such a rule, which for instance in the Netherlands is rather strict, will hamper adjustments of supply and demand in the labour market.

In general, the relation between educational policy and labour market policy has not been a matter of thorough discussion in the seven countries. Moreover, relevant research findings are scarce. The danger is that unexpected and unintended consequences of present policies may interfere with both educational policy goals and goals of economic and social policy.

The working party therefore recommends:

- Governments should stimulate studies on the functioning of the labour market and the effects of educational policy on this functioning to make sure that unexpected and unintended consequences of educational policies in the labour market do not interfere with overall goals and values of society nor wit. the goals of educational policy itself.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

With regard to the general line of policy:

- Governments' policies should be directed towards developing a system of tertiary education, diversified as to purposes and levels of programmes, and to planning tertiary education as a single system. Higher education policy should be broadened to become tertiary education policy.

With regard to policy goals:

- Governments should explicitly accept as goals of their tertiary education policy: preparation for the labour market, the advancement of knowledge, the furthering of cultural life and participation in all sectors of public life and personal growth. A balanced orientation towards these goals can in many fields of study be achieved by programmes of a broad and fundamental character in the initial stage of tertiary education. On the other hand, specific and very practical programmes may be more appropriate for some types of youngsters, also from the point of view of personal growth.

- Governments should use deliberately the four goals for a policy of diversification with respect to content of programmes, admission and selection, degree requirements, types of students to be served, priorities in expansion and decisions on quantitative planning.

- Governments and other agencies in charge of science and research policy should strengthen the research function in tertiary education by a careful assignment of research functions to institutions and of research duties to teachers, and by a corresponding allocation of resources. The organisational settings of research should be reconsidered both from the angle of educational policy and science and research policy.

- Governments should promote the creation of channels of information between the educational sector and other sectors of society to enable educational institutions to adapt their programmes to what society and individuals need.

- tertiary education institutions, as stores of educational experience and centres of knowledge, should not only orient themselves towards individuals (students), but also enable institutions outside the field of education to take part in activities of recurrent education and to be innovative.

With regard to equal educational opportunity:

- Governments should, in executing a policy of equal education opportunity explore systematically the possibilities of broader admission rules.

- Governments should procure the legal possibilities, the information and instruments to achieve a fair distribution of educational provisions for the whole population.

- Governments should, more specifically, develop a deliberate policy with regard to quantitative planning.

With regard to effectiveness and efficiency:

- Governments and institutions should clearly define criteria of effectiveness, such as maximally acceptable proportions of drop-outs, acceptable length of study, minimum levels of performance of students, desired research activities, and they should direct their policies towards meeting these criteria.

- Governments and institutions should establish criteria of efficiency, and more particularly they should pay attention to a balanced allocation of time for teaching, research and administration, to the evaluation of different methods of teaching both from the points of view of effectiveness and efficiency, to a lowering of drop-out rates, to a reasonable relation between length of study time and length of courses and to research productivity of teachers.

- Governments should increase efficiency in the institutions by furthering a democratic governance system which allows the functioning of competent administrators and they should increase cost consciousness by finance systems which allow an efficient use of resources while taking into account both the principle of self-administration and the rule of accountability for public funds.

- Governments and institutions should prevent unnecessarily lengthy routes through tertiary education by co-ordination of programmes and by a system of credit points (exemptions).

- Governments and institutions should design, where possible, their longer programmes as a series of short, complete, programmes, to reduce drop-outs and to shorten length of study.

- Governments and institutions should pay great attention to the counselling of students before and during their study.

With regard to the building of a system of tertiary education :

- Governments should promote part-time education, and, as a component of part-time education, independent study systems.

- Governments should not stimulate demand for tertiary education among school leavers but encourage, in the framework of recurrent education policy, programmes which correspond with the career needs of adults as well as with the needs of other adult roles and with personal interests.

- Governments should design the future development of tertiary education systems with a balanced concern for equal educational opportunity, effectiveness and efficiency.

- Governments should, in order to carry out the preceding recommendation, foster differentiated but co-ordinated programmes on the first level of tertiary education, design long university programmes as a sequence of programmes and give priority to short-cycle programmes in creating new study places.

- Governments should take measures to promote in institutions the ability and willingness to feel responsible for the success of the students they have accepted as capable students.

With regard to the relations between tertiary education policy and the labour market :

- Governments should stimulate studies on the functioning of the labour market and the effects of educational policy on this functioning to make sure that unexpected and unintended consequences of educational policies in the labour market do not interfere with overall goals and values of society nor with the goals of educational policy itself.

# PART II

## Analysis and evaluation of tertiary education policy in seven countries:

## Cyprus, France, Greece, Italy, Portugal, Spain, Turkey (1)

by

The Chairman and Rapporteur of the Working Party:

Doyen Georges VEDEL
Paris - France

---

Recommendations of the Working Party

---

## INTRODUCTION

1. In accordance with its terms of reference, as given above (foreword), the working party took for its geographical field of study the countries of Southern Europe which had agreed to play an active part in its work, namely Cyprus, France, Greece, Italy, Portugal, Spain and Turkey. Between 1977 and 1979 meetings took place in each of these countries (in chronological order in Toledo, Rome, Ankara, Granada, Delphi, Braga, Paris and Nicosia) (1), at each of which specialists from the country under consideration submitted reports on various aspects of the subject (the general organisation of tertiary education, its links with the general educational system, the diversification of establishments and methods, the status of teaching staff, student access, the autonomy of establishments, participation in research etc). These reports then came under discussion. In the final phase, a general report on each country was presented under the responsibility of the members of the working party. An amalgam of these reports forms the first part of the present publication.

A word must be said about the case of France. France was in fact represented and studied in the "Northern Europe" Working Party (France, Federal Republic of Germany, Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, United Kingdom). However, her geographical position warranted her being considered once again in the "Southern Europe" group. As France is the subject of a national report in the northern group, the southern group simply requested a supplementary report.

2. It may be useful to state what the Southern Europe Working Party understood its task to be in the light of the terms of reference it was given. In this respect three points must be noted:

- the definition of "tertiary education";
- the concept of "diversification";
- the relationship to be established between the proceedings and conclusions concerning Northern Europe and those on Southern Europe.

3. Tertiary education. On this point the working party referred to the definition accepted by the former Committee for Higher Education and Research of the Council for Cultural Co-operation (former CCC, now CDCC), which is formulated as follows in Professor de MOOR's report on behalf of the "Northern Europe" Working Party:

> "Tertiary education ... embraces all education for youth and adults beginning at the age of 17-19, depending on the countries' educational systems, and requiring either completion of secondary education, or at least three or four years of secondary schooling with some years of practical experience." (Changing tertiary education in modern European society, Strasbourg, 1978, page 253)

---

(1) The meetings in Toledo and Granada were symposia connected with the programme on diversification in Southern Europe but not, strictly speaking, meetings of the group.

The term "tertiary (post-secondary) education" fits in well with this definition in that it specifically covers all forms of education which follow secondary education and have a different level and purpose.

It should nevertheless be clearly understood that the definition does not imply any necessary continuity between secondary and tertiary education or even between the different levels or fields of study in tertiary education. The fact is that tertiary education increasingly encompasses education intended for mature adults already in a settled occupation who are seeking new professional qualifications or simply a broader cultural background.

4. Diversification. Similarly, the term "diversification" will be used in the meaning it has in the work relating to Northern Europe.

Again, we reproduce below a passage from the published version of this work:

> "Classical systems of higher (university) education can neither fulfil the various individual educational demands of an increasingly heterogeneous student body, nor are they able to meet the educational needs of technologically-advanced, democratic European societies for a large variety of skills and qualifications. The answer to these problems is the development of classical systems of higher education into diversified systems of tertiary education characterised by a greater range of options varying as to purposes and levels.
>
> Diversification of tertiary education implies:
>
> - a clear distinction between the various goals of tertiary education (and of education as such),
> - the creation of a diversity of institutions and of courses in tertiary education fulfilling both the individual educational demands and the educational needs of society,
> - diversification of admission to the various courses and institutions,
> - an integrated policy of planning, development and reform covering the whole diversified system of tertiary education" (op. cit. page 3).

However, this reference has a different scope from the definition of "tertiary (post-secondary) education" (see No. 3 above), which was a neutral one not implying any value judgement or standard such as those involved, implicitly or explicitly, in the passage just quoted relating to diversification.

In its own field of study the working party prefers not to commit itself on the above value judgement or standards, for the propositions in question cannot necessarily be all regarded as self-evident. It is in no way certain, for example, that it is possible to fulfil "both ... individual educational demands and the educational needs of society", unless one believes in a fore-ordained harmony between the two sides which has never been demonstrated experimentally on a sufficiently general scale. In this matter, the alternatives may be an independent ruling in favour of one of the two types of needs or a highly empirical compromise between the two, without any third party in the form of the fore-ordained harmony. It may also be true that "planning, development and reform" (op. cit. page 3) cannot co-exist as harmoniously as is suggested in the passage quoted. Heaven has been known to perform miracles for the benefit of individuals but few are recorded for the benefit of societies.

5. Relationship to be established between the work on Northern and Southern Europe. This was obviously one of the main problems confronting the working party.

As far as the countries of Northern Europe go, Professor de MOOR (op. cit., pages 251-252) observed with sound judgement that in spite of the similarities between these countries,

> "... it is not the case that there is only one proper tertiary education policy for them, even if educational needs and the main problems to be solved by policy are similar. Educational systems are in manifold ways interwoven with other sectors of society. And societies are different in the seven countries: different in their values, at least in the hierarchy of them, different in their socio-economic and political structure. They have been so in the past, and this has led to different patterns of education that cannot be ignored in reforms. Moreover, reforms are part of politics. Non-educational interests, values and responsibilities are, therefore, involved in them. It will be obvious, therefore, that there is no single solution to opt for".

If this is true of a relatively homogeneous group of countries, we should be even more on our guard against applying to Southern Europe conclusions or solutions drawn from comparisons with the Northern countries. It is in no way certain that exporting educational models is any easier or any more to the point than exporting cultural or political models.

However, this is not the place for going into the fundamentals of the problem: that will be done later. We should simply like to point out here that the problem received special attention from the working party, having been expressly mentioned in their terms of reference and also because there is no ready-made solution to it one way or the other.

o

o o

## CHAPTER I

## GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF THE AREA STUDIED

6. The "Southern Europe" entity is obviously capable of geographical definition, even if the inclusion of France in it introduces a partial, but inevitable, irregularity.

It is nevertheless justifiable to ask how far this entity is really homogeneous from the point of view of the working party's subject of study.

Naturally, this question cannot be posed as a preliminary. In the first place, it is impossible to reply to the question before studying tertiary education and its diversification in the seven countries concerned and lack of certainty on this point would be no justification for not carrying out the study at all. Secondly, if it turned out that the area under consideration was in fact heterogeneous, this conclusion, though disappointing, would still represent a fact from which deductions should be drawn. While any search for knowledge naturally aims at the most general results possible, a limited discovery which falls short of this ideal is worth more than inaccurate propositions based on over-generalisations.

Nevertheless, the working party's results allow us to go beyond this initial question: from the point of view with which we are concerned, namely tertiary education and its diversification, the undeniable differences from country to country are broadly offset by the parallels and similarities.

7. The differences. The most obvious difference is the variety of political and economic organisations and contexts.

From a political point of view, it is true that the seven countries under consideration are democratic according to the most commonly accepted criteria: power stemming from free elections, a representative system of government, the recognition and exercise of individual and social rights and public liberties. However, apart from the fact that even at present the political systems followed have considerable differences, it must be remembered that four out of the seven countries (Spain, Greece, Portugal and Cyprus) have undergone substantial political changes in the recent past. In a world in which the university in the traditional sense of the term is both an arena and an object of political struggle, this is a fact which cannot be neglected and may give rise to differences.

From the economic point of view, it is necessary to stress the highly important differences in developmental patterns. The economy has many and varied links with the education system in general, and with tertiary education in particular. Economic capacity is the principal factor governing the financial means of both. The economic structure (the relative importance and state of development of industry, agriculture and the tertiary sector, the ratio of the public to the private sector, and the proportion of small to large companies) largely determines society's need for workers who have

received tertiary education. Inevitably, the tertiary education system has a reciprocal effect on the economy. Even more than differences in political systems, organisational and developmental differences in the economic field create variations in the educational system and detract from the unity of the field studied.

8. Yet other differences particular to this field must be pointed out.

Depending on the country under consideration, there is considerable variation in the age of the university tradition in which the diversification of tertiary education is to take root. One could say that resistance to change is proportional to this age.

Differences in influences from other countries must also be kept in mind however. Italy and Spain, for example, have been inspired, at least in part, by the "Napoleonic" model of French universities; Turkey and Greece have been more sensitive to the German model. The more recent influence of the United States has not been felt everywhere to the same extent.

9. The examples just given of factors detracting from the unity of the area under consideration are of course not exhaustive: many others must exist.

Nevertheless, what has been stated suffices to show that, on some very important points, the treatment of the problems within the scope of this study is far from uniform and gives rise to solutions which may even at times be at variance with one another: for example, the degree to which university and non-university teaching are integrated within tertiary education; student access to such education; and centralisation versus autonomy of educational establishments.

10. Similarities and convergence. While, as we have shown, our field of study is not perfectly homogeneous, it is nevertheless not artificial. On the contrary, as will be shown below, the whole range of problems in tertiary education in the countries under consideration displays a unity which, though not perfect, is striking. To a great extent, this is certainly due to parallels in social evolution, which extend considerably beyond Southern Europe since they are noticeable well outside the area, both in highly developed and in developing countries. Even so, such homogeneity is also due to factors peculiar to the area under study, which correct the divergences, not to speak of the antitheses, pointed out above.

11. The differences in the type and level of economic development in the seven countries under consideration are not accompanied by any parallel hierarchy in cultural and educational development. All these countries have longstanding cultural traditions, which have in many cases influenced Europe and the world and represent a sound foundation for the development of the education system. Moreover, in the past the universities in the countries in question have benefited more than other types of education from this cultural tradition, and so those countries are well-placed to develop and transform tertiary education, though they also have the problem of its links with education at other levels or of other types.

As for political changes, they have certainly had a significant influence on many aspects of the education system, particularly where the autonomy of teaching establishments and teachers' freedom are concerned. Nevertheless, in the three countries previously under authoritarian regimes, these changes have been in the direction of democracy, and the variety of the roads to democracy has not modified their basic similarity to each other or to the other countries of Southern Europe. Furthermore, the return to democracy has not changed everything: even before the return to democracy in Spain, Greece and Portugal, various objective needs (for modernisation, diversification and qualitative and quantitative development) had been felt, especially around 1970, and had given rise to "technical" reforms, often of positive value, some parts of which have survived.

In short, while the tradition of a given "model" may still exert an influence today, that influence has been reduced by the reforms undertaken, and especially those around 1970 just mentioned. Besides, how could one remain faithful to those "models" when they had been challenged and profoundly modified in the very countries which had originally created them? It is therefore not surprising that, especially where the goals of tertiary education and its diversification are concerned, innovation has reformed the traditional universities as much as it has created institutions of a new sort.

12. Perhaps one should go further and work on the assumption, which needs to be tested but nevertheless seems tenable, that the countries under consideration bear a social and cultural similarity in the matter of the function and significance of diplomas, and especially of university degrees.

It seems indeed that in Mediterranean countries, university degrees are more of a social symbol than in Northern countries. There may be various reasons for this. One of these reasons is probably the characteristic those countries share in having less industry and commerce, or at least to having developed them later. Some aspects of social advancement (salaries, social standing, competition with the highly-born) depend more on signs of rank (including university degrees) than on success in activities which do not rely on degrees. Another reason is almost certainly that in the diversification of post-secondary education the Northern countries are in the lead, with the result that university degrees as distinct from other diplomas are regarded even by employers as a sign of fitness for an occupation. Historians might suggest also that, in countries where the ecclesiastical hierarchy has played an important role, the "clerk" has acquired special social prestige.

Whatever the reasons are, the fact remains that diplomas, and university degrees in particular, have a special importance in the establishment in Southern European countries.

Another characteristic combines with this to make the desire of young people and their families for wide access to universities more pressing and, on occasions, more violent. University degrees can be thought of as an endorsement certifying the acquisition of a high level of culture for its own sake or else as a means of gaining access to certain posts, in particular those allocated or supervised by the authorities. These views could combine without difficulty in times when higher education was intended for a small minority of well-off students already sifted in the course of secondary schooling. With the advent of universal education, the time seemed to have come for making a choice: either university study could be open to all according to their preferences and individual cultural goals but without any guarantee of a corresponding job; or it could assure the successful student of a professional future, in which case university entrance had to be guided in certain directions and limited. Young people and their families in Southern European countries seem to reject this choice much more vigorously than in Northern Europe or the United States. They want to have it both ways: free, non-directed access to higher education as well as guaranteed employment. The phenomenon has given rise to several explanations. One of the most likely is the importance in those countries of posts allocated by the rulers - in modern terms the state - a process which made for squirearchies of clannish family groups.

In short, irrespective of its causes, there is a sort of common social and cultural core in the attitude of families and young people towards universities and, consequently, towards tertiary education: a demand for right of entrance, for degrees and for the employment of graduates, which makes those concerned unusually vehement and resistant to both selection and to guidance on entry. When it comes to reaching a decision or working out a compromise between "society's needs and individual demands" (see paragraph 4 above), the opinions of young people and their families are resolutely in favour of the second option.

13. There is another characterstic shared by the seven countries, which perhaps is not specific to Southern Europe. Since the end of the 1960s there has been a proliferation of reforms, some of them complementary and others contradictory, with a conflict between tradition and innovation, resulting in an extremely mobile university environment.

Legislation which appears to mark a clear break with the past and to open an entirely new course for the future was adopted in France towards the end of 1968. However, the changes affected only half of the tertiary education system, since it did not cover the "grandes écoles", and what is more the changes have themselves been changed, either by further legislation or in practice. The regulations of August 1979, awaited since 1968, have finally defined the status of the universities' teaching staff.

Even so, the situation in France appears remarkably stable in comparison to that in Italy. While this report is being written, projects on university reform exist and the status of the teaching staff, many working data are still based on conjecture, in any case one cannot draw on any experience of the reforms envisaged and whose future seems uncertain.

In 1970 Spain overhauled the entire educational system, with a view to making profound changes in the previous system, which dated back to the 19th century. Yet even before the new system has been completely put into operation, new proposals are appearing. Moreover, a Royal Decree of 5 April 1979 has set up a Ministry for the Universities and Research, in place of the former State Secretariat of the same name.

The situation in Turkey appears more stable, but nevertheless there have been changes brought about by law or the course of events.

In Greece, a 1978 Act (No. 815) effected far-reaching reforms in some aspects of the tertiary education system, following a considerable number of changes in the past.

After an initial reform Act in 1973 and the vicissitudes brought about by the political changes of 1974, Portugal is now carrying out a reform of the education system whose effects will be spread out over some time, and has taken various significant measures affecting tertiary education.

Lastly, in Cyprus the situation is the opposite to that in the other countries but it too is tending towards change and mobility. Cyprus possesses an extensive system of non-university tertiary education, but for various reasons - mainly to enable its young people wishing to take a university course to do so without going abroad - it is thinking of providing itself with a university. The results of preliminary studies have confirmed the value of such a project.

This generally unsettled state of affairs gives the group's work both its interest and its difficulty. The interest stems from the fact that the changes involve both a criticism of previous conditions and a choice of future solutions. The difficulty lies in the fact that some important information remains hypothetical, especially where reform bills have still to go before parliament, and also in the fact that it is impossible to judge from experience the value of reforms that have not yet had a chance to prove themselves.

14. In conclusion, the overall impression arising from the working party's documents and discussions is that the problems are largely the same. The need for better links between the education system as a whole and tertiary education is felt generally; in all these countries, the problems of student access to tertiary education and employment following graduation are keenly felt; everywhere there is the issue of the status of teaching staff of non-professorial rank in universities; and in every country the relationship between the traditional system and the new institutions, student participation, the autonomy of university institutions etc are being discussed and studied.

This shared body of problems and the numerous parallels or similarities which characterise their social context suggest the presentation of a comprehensive view. This view will have to take account both of national peculiarities and of the parallels or similarities amongst the various countries under study. It will no doubt be more difficult to correlate the conclusions reached with those formulated in the report by Professor de MOOR on Northern Europe, but the difficulties will be instructive in themselves.

## CHAPTER II

## GOALS AND FUNCTIONS OF TERTIARY EDUCATION

### SECTION I - Apparent agreement on the goals and functions of tertiary education

15. There are few subjects on which a soundly established consensus appears to exist than on the aims and functions of tertiary education. This consensus is to be found within each country and between the various countries studied.

From the official bodies in charge of tertiary education to the general public, and including teachers and students, everyone is agreed in ascribing to tertiary education a series of goals which might be listed as follows:

- It seeks the advancement and spread of science and culture in their most disinterested form, it being assumed that this primary aim also implies the secondary aim of more or less immediate social utility.

- Its mission of research (fundamental and applied) follows from these aims and is based on the observation that, since knowledge must be communicated and spread, it follows of necessity that it must be brought into being, which is a permanent process of creation.

- As the need for knowledge and culture is part and parcel of the human condition, tertiary education has the task of aiding people to satisfy this need. This is true both of young people who depend largely on access to higher education for the development of their personalities and their aptitude to grow into enlightened citizens related to the world they live in, and also of older ones who wish to supplement their intellectual training, keep it alive or bring it up-to-date.

- Amongst the persons to whom tertiary education must be available, special mention must be made of those whose occupation will be to teach in schools or in any type of teaching institution, both pre-tertiary and tertiary, and this implies an educational function in the widest sense at all levels.

- . Furthermore, tertiary education has a vocational aim. Independently of teacher training, it must provide society with the leaders needed for civic and economic life. While the public authorities cannot guarantee every student individually that he will find the employment of his choice, men and women with tertiary education must have reasonable statistical chances of using their training in an occupation suitable to it. This requirement has two sides: on the one hand, students must be able to fulfil their vocations in fields that correspond to their aspirations and aptitudes, and on the other hand society must be able to find the leaders, executives and high-grade technicians it needs.

- Finally, there is a more or less explicit aspiration for tertiary education to have a "political" function in the widest sense. By tradition, the universities and, no doubt, tertiary education in general, have two characteristics. Firstly, taken as a whole they are considerably freer than other social institutions. At least according to the democratic ideal, students and teachers are much less dependent on the institutional hierarchies and ideological beliefs of the society which surrounds them. They have usually absorbed social norms and values to a lesser extent than other groups. The second characteristic, which stems from the first, is that the universities have always had a "critical" function, not only, as is natural, in relation to scientific and cultural knowledge, whose advancement is their duty, but also in regard to society as a whole.

This last aim is not the one that receives the most enthusiastic approval but the principle of the critical function of the university and of tertiary education generally is not in itself attacked in any democratic country, even if abuses of and deviations from it are challenged and sometimes combatted.

16. The above list of the aims of tertiary education is quite likely not exhaustive. Other functions could be added, such as that of providing the country with a reserve of specialists in various fields ("brains trusts", sometimes with an impressive number of professors) or simply of athletes, though this characteristic does not seem very marked in Southern Europe.

The important thing is that the combination of these aims is considered possible and highly desirable. It is remarkable that practically nowhere is any order of priority among them acknowledged. No-one suggests, for example, that research should take precedence over teaching, or vocational training over general culture. No doubt individual preferences are expressed, especially by teaching staff, but even those teachers who have the most categorical ideas on the subject will hesitate to consider conflicts between different aims as contradictions. At most they will advocate a return to a fairer balance between the various aims. As a rule students, far from acknowledging any contradiction, demand that any potential

conflict to be eliminated. In all the countries under study they claim the right not only to choose their courses but also to organise their work according to their interests, without any external constraint of a practical nature, and also the right to employment. It is true that, concerning this last point, a trend towards greater realism can be observed in several countries.

Obviously it is never pleasant to disturb such a sound consensus but we must look for any fallacies and for methods used to disguise real underlying contradictions. The work of criticism will not be negative if it results in positive recommendations.

SECTION II - Conflicts and contradictions

17. Naturally, each of the aims mentioned above, as well as others that one could add, is in itself highly desirable, but together they create a problem of compatibility.

In order to avoid going from one extreme to another, we must avoid replacing a conception of aims related in fore-ordained harmony by the view of a battlefield of warring aims. In fact, the analysis ought to be considerably more sensitive and based on fine distinctions.

In some cases there is a real and necessary convergence of desirable goals, and the idea of a contradiction between them ought to be rejected. Where problems exist, they are a matter of organisation. This is true of the aims of teaching and of research.

In a second group of cases there are real contradictions which cannot be eliminated but can allow for an acceptable "modus vivendi" by way of compromise: for example between the function of general culture and that of specialised training.

Finally, there are cases where the contradiction is serious, if not insoluble, and, unlike the organisational problems in the first example or the need for compromise in the second, creates problems of general social organisation. This is true of the issue of widespread student access with free choice of course in tertiary education coupled with the problem of practical value to the economy.

We shall now take these points with the graduated distinctions made above.

18. The aims of teaching and research are not merely convergent but co-extensive, to borrow a term from philosophy. The reasons for this deep-seated and almost fundamental connection are so obvious that one need only to list them without expanding on them. In order to teach at tertiary level; in other words communicate knowledge, one must have a living body of learning at one's disposal, not congealed, introverted learning. A professor is not a crammer or a populariser of science. On the other hand, a research worker must as a rule pass on his knowledge and train assistants and successors, which he can do by teaching, at least at some levels. Then, too, it is in the interest of students who have reached a particular stage of progress to be given methods of acquiring knowledge rather than ready-made learning, and they should therefore have had at least an initiation into research.

How may one foresee possible conflicts between these aims?

On the lowest, day-to-day level a conflict may arise quite simply from the nature or excessive burden of teaching duties. This overload is purely a matter of timetables. Teaching is an intellectually and physically tiring task: if the year's programme and the timetable of a teacher are overloaded (with lectures, examinations and administrative tasks), he will at best only manage to keep his knowledge up to date, without being able to take part himself in the advancement of knowledge. The type of teaching involved is itself of great importance: post-graduate level teaching on freely-chosen subjects, to students who are following the same line, if not assisting with it, fits in perfectly with research, the preparation of courses being a work close to that of publishing scientific findings. This is not true of teaching very general subjects to first-year undergraduates: here research has little to do with teaching, and if a teacher in this position wants to keep a foothold in research, he must set some time aside for laboratory or library work. Solutions to such conflicts are not beyond reach, however. They can be summarised in two proposals: easing the lecture timetables and year's programme of lecturers, and greater movement of teaching staff between the various levels, to avoid their growing stale through being kept too long at the more elementary levels.

&

It is worthwhile repeating these points, for there is often a tendancy amongst governments, supported by some sections of public opinion, to consider the teaching hours of tertiary education personnel to be too few or the length of university vacations too long. But the idea of measuring "production" by the number of hours of lectures demanded of each teacher is completely misleading, since an overload of teaching work results in emptying the teaching of its substance, and that is in fact a negative result.

The foregoing remarks need some qualification, however. The term "research" is in fact used to denote two different kinds of activity.

One activity is aimed at maintaining rather than creating knowledge. Every tertiary-level teacher needs to keep fully abreast of new developments in his field. He can do this by reading books and journals, attending conferences or symposia, etc. This may be called "acquisitive" research.

The other activity also called research - but more aptly so - is aimed not at assimilating new knowledge but at helping to produce it. This is "creative" research.

It may be wondered whether all tertiary-sector establishments and teachers are also involved in creative research as well as acquisitive research. It scarcely seems possible to regard all tertiary-education establishments as having a creative research function. Since the very effect of diversification is to increase the number of such establishments and include among them many purely vocational training schools offering "short" courses, it has to be acknowledged that many establishments will not be equipped for creative research. To assume otherwise would be to waste resources intended for laboratories and libraries and divert the establishments concerned from their true function. As a rule, creative research should be left to universities and comparable establishments.

The situation as regards teaching staff is more complicated. In the case of university staff, it has to be acknowledged that creative research is a natural function of theirs. This should be reflected in their professional regulations, especially with regard to the provision of the necessary amount of "spare time" for research. But perhaps the regulations should also be modulated to allow for the variety of cases. It should be possible for a teacher engaged in a particularly difficult research project to be relieved of some of his teaching and administrative duties provided, of course, this is found to be justified. In other cases, an effort should be made to assign the teacher to courses to which his research is relevant - which is already often done at postgraduate level.

The staff of establishments without any intrinsic research functions should not be subjected to regulations which prohibit or prevent them from engaging in creative research. Naturally, however, not everyone can be given the necessary time or facilities for such research. The ones with the appropriate aptitude, motivation and speciality will need to be selected for a trial in creative research. The trial should be long enough to be conclusive but not so long as to open the door to abuse, and it should be facilitated by half-time or sabbatical leave arrangements.

19. The other possible conflict which may arise between the teaching and research functions stems from the state's acknowledgement of its duty to aid research but also to guide it. From this point of view, universities and tertiary education in general have a disadvantage in the eyes of the authorities. Their status is ill-suited to any really direct guidance of research. This creates perhaps fewer disadvantages for basic research than for applied research, all the more so since in most countries the universities seem to experience difficulty in keeping themselves informed of the economy's needs, and are almost everywhere reluctant, probably for fear of losing their independence or from ideological mistrust, to work together with industry, especially under research contracts. It is also possible that research's manpower requirements in the various countries may be greater than tertiary education staff can satisfy.

Tertiary education, one notices everywhere, is far from enjoying a monopoly of research. Whereas in all countries universities co-operate in research, they neither direct nor have exclusive rights in it. Descriptions of the organisation of research and the various parties sharing in research budgets (cf the various national reports) show this clearly. At times, it may even have seemed that the state has resorted to a kind of division of labour, with research organisations proper dealing with the discovery and development of knowledge and the universities passing it on. Most fortunately, this temptation, which would have been as disastrous for research as for teaching, has been resisted, but it is always lying in wait.

Yet even the conflict which may arise here can be smoothed over. This requires a joint effort:

The state should assign a place of importance to tertiary education institutions in its research organisation, thus allowing for a profitable co-existence of the two partners. This should be made clear by including specific and substantial grants for research in the budgets of these institutions. Quite apart from these grants, to be used as the university wishes, the state should also propose specific research programmes under contract, with supplementary grants, to specific universities which are particularly well-equipped in men and material for them.

It usually falls to the tertiary education establishments, firstly, to organise the research programmes internally, to work with external bodies and to be receptive to contact with and proposals from industry without automatic mistrust.

On the whole, the claim that there is no real contradiction or conflict for tertiary education between the aims of teaching and of research can be seen to have been correct. The recommendations to be made in this field imply common-sense arrangements.

20. While one cannot speak of deep-rooted conflicts, other aims of tertiary education that are acknowledged as essential cannot be integrated so harmoniously as teaching and research. This is true of the cultural and specialised training aims. The conflict is of concern to the students, and is not to be identified with the more serious problem to which we shall come back, of how to reconcile the goal of wide, free access to tertiary education with employment and economic efficiency.

The question we wish to pose at the moment is simply this. Take the case of a student in a particular branch of tertiary study, intended to give him a specialised training. He cannot concurrently study arts, sciences, economics, architecture, and so on; but should he be given a general cultural background, either in the context of his specialised training or outside it? And if so, how?

This is a very frequent subject of concern amongst students. Some countries have witnessed a demand among students in traditional faculties for more specialised training with a practical bias, simultaneously with a demand among the students of specialised vocational colleges for the introduction of general cultural subjects into their syllabuses.

The conflict between the two systems cannot be doubted. It can be reduced, if not resolved, by a compromise whose nature will depend in the final analysis of the resources available.

One could in fact conceive, at least theoretically, of a type of pre-tertiary education without over-specialisation, covering simply two or three major fields of study: for example, arts or sciences. This would lead young people on to tertiary education with a wide general culture, and they would then be able to specialise

without the danger of being cut off from culture. This model, which did in fact exist in most countries, is no longer practical, having been based entirely on an "elitist" conception of secondary education which itself presupposed two conditions:' firstly, that secondary education should not be provided for pupils who were to take up employment without university study; and secondly, secondary teaching should consequently offer no prospects of vocational specialisation. In all countries, this stage of development has been superseded. Compulsory schooling now extends beyond childhood to cover adolescence. However, as completely universal tertiary education has not been achieved, secondary schooling leads straight to professional life for those who do not go on to tertiary education. Consequently, it is not possible to conceive of secondary schooling of the traditional kind, with a purely cultural aim.

A balance between general culture and specialisation must therefore be achieved during the course of tertiary studies for students who have not acquired an extensive cultural background in secondary school. There are many ways of bringing about this balance, but all require the use of certain resources and thus an effort in a particular direction.

Broadly speaking, two models are feasible. The first would be to introduce a year's general education between the end of secondary school and specialisation at tertiary level. This would be "disinterested" and in that it would aim at allowing the student both to familiarise himself with his special subject, and to relate to the national and international society he will become part of as an adult. Such a preparatory course system is in itself excellent, but is expensive, requiring at least a year of "gratuitous" study. When added to longer training courses, it would represent an extra fifth or quarter, or a half when added to shorter courses. As resources are limited, it would mean qualitative or quantitative restrictions on other fronts. Thus, in spite of the favour this sytem once enjoyed in some countries, it seems to be no longer followed, at least in the form of all-round preparatory training.

The second model, which is already in practice and is to be recommended, consists in allotting sufficient space to general education subjects in already specialised syllabuses, whether these have a more theoretical or a more practical bias. It is not a question of somewhat artificial covering aimed at producing a multi-disciplinary façade (like offsetting reinforced concrete technology by courses in Latin literature). Happily, it seems that, even in the context of the special subject, the introduction of the historical background, the general theoretical foundations, the social environment etc, as required, can preserve students from the staleness of specialisation and the cultural poverty that it may engender. We may thus hope to reconcile general education and specialised training without lengthening the study time. The sacrifices this system entails are indeed sometimes beneficial in themselves, even from the point of view of "efficiency". To take an example, giving law students a basic knowledge of economics and the broad outlines of foreign law will be of more practical use to them than over-specialisation in national legal practises, which can be readily acquired with a little individual work or, if need be, as part of professional training, once a sound knowledge of the foundations has been assimilated.

Thus it cannot be said that the aims of general culture and that of specialised training are necessarily in harmony, but the conflict is not insoluble.

21. In our opinion, the difficulty experienced in combining two other goals is greater not only in degree but in type. These goals are personal fulfilment in freely chosen studies and the rational training (planned if possible), of professional people to meet the needs of the administration and the economy, who must be assured of finding employment corresponding to their studies. The problem is one both of quantity and of quality.

The quantitative difficulty, which will be mentioned again and again throughout this report, is that the number of posts presupposing the use of knowledge acquired in tertiary education is limited, especially with low-economic development. Hence the universal problem, particularly acute in some of the countries studied, of lack of balance between the level of tertiary education given to a large body of students and the level of employment offered. This raises not only the question of jobs for students, which is solved in variable proportions by unemployment and employment below their qualifications, but also the problem of this situation's effects: a low-economic return on the resources made available to tertiary education, and a section of youth encamped on the fringes of the society in which they should be living.

The qualitative difficulty stems from the fact that not only do young people (and their families) aspire to tertiary education, but they are reluctant to accept, or reject outright, any kind of limitations on the choice of course. As already pointed out, it seems to be a characteristic of the countries under consideration that two essentially contradictory demands flourish side by side among those concerned, and even in public opinion generally: for the right not just to freedom of access to tertiary education, but also to freedom of choice among the courses offered and also the right to employment related to the degree obtained. There is indeed a third demand not always made explicit: for the right to guaranteed degrees.

22. This all too real contradiction will underlie many of the remarks in later parts of this report. We therefore need not discuss it fully here, and for the moment, shall limit ourselves to a few general remarks.

The contradiction is "managed" in fact in all the countries of Southern Europe, though with varied means and differing force, by two processes. The first is diversification itself. Tertiary education no longer comprises only the traditional faculties - if it ever did - but also new types of courses, institutions and training corresponding to the diversified needs of society. This creates better prospects both for the fulfilment of individual aspirations and for the employment of graduates.

The second process is the regulation of young people's access to tertiary education by various degrees of restrictions combined with guidance. The first method (diversification) tends to respond to and increase the supply of jobs; the second (selection and guidance) tends to act on the demand for jobs.

At least in the form of selection, if not of guidance, the second process, unlike the first, is in fact considered a mere expedient which should gradually disappear. Ideally, diversification should be so successful that degrees and posts are in almost total harmony. In the medium- to long-term, one might be tempted to think, that is the real solution, and firm recommendations should be made to this end. To put it in a nutshell, one could be inclined to recommend that the countries of Southern Europe should imitate those of Northern Europe.

23. Unfortunately, things are more complicated than that. The first reason for this is obvious. The number of posts requiring high qualifications depends on economic development. Thus, while one may succeed in qualitatively suiting diplomas to posts requiring qualifications through a policy of course guidance (which is not really accepted), adapting them quantitatively depends only slightly, if at all, on tertiary education policy proper. Such an adjustment depends on development policy, which in turn depends largely on optimal allocation of resources in the economic system under study. Even if one's ideal is a society in which tertiary education will be open to all and will lead to employment corresponding to the training given, it may be that progress towards this society presupposes an allocation of resources in which tertiary education will have only moderate priority. It is possible that in such a country investment in energy production, agriculture etc takes precedence over investment in tertiary education.

Such remarks are generally regarded as sacreligious or as betraying an obsession with economics. More relevantly, they may be criticised for ignoring the fact that a society's development is largely governed by its educational level, so that any miserliness towards the education system would defeat its own ends.

Nevertheless, the problem must be expressed in such a way as not to mislead public opinion into the facile idea that the development of tertiary education is not only a moral priority but an absolute economic priority that overrides the need for calculation. The truth is that tertiary education is neither waste nor cure-all, but simply one component part, working both as cause and as effect, in economic development. When one examines the most highly developed countries it becomes clear that the development of their socio-economic systems and that of their education systems have not stemmed from a categorical choice in favour of one or the other but from combined bursts of growth, deliberate or not, which made for mutual support. Imbalance on either side is to be feared.

24. There is another reason for being on one's guard against simplistic solutions. This is that, in many of the countries being considered here the development of tertiary education in certain quantitative respects has reached figures which are largely comparable to those of countries with much more powerful economies. In relation to national population, the student numbers of a given Southern European country may be comparable to those of the Federal Republic of Germany or the United Kingdom, in spite of different economic levels, and the pressure towards increased numbers is no less, but rather the contrary.

This modifies somewhat the direction of the imbalance, and consequently of the action required to restore the balance. It may be that in some Southern European countries the wisest policy would be not only to guide students more actively, but also to limit increases in numbers for a time. This should be done not out of lack of confidence in the growth of the educational system but in order to place it on sound economic foundations.

25. However undeniable the merits of diversification, and however good the results one may expect of it, it must be stated that, in spite of the benefit that the development of any education system brings to society's material as well as moral basis, adjustment remains necessary between the education system as a whole, including the tertiary sector and other parts of society.

This is all the more true because of the need for choices within the education system itself. We are confronted with the old problem of knowing where to concentrate effort, in order to produce direct and secondary effects: whether to put emphasis on the development of tertiary education, counting on repercussions at other levels as a result of the greater numbers of trained teachers, or to develop secondary education progressively in order to feed the tertiary sector. There is no sure solution to this problem; a choice has to be made, in which consideration of the teacher-training situation will play a major part.

## SECTION III - The aims policy

26. Of all the recommendations that have to be made, perhaps the most important would be to point out that there are no foreordained harmonies on whose indulgence those responsible for the education system (ministers, administrators and teachers) can count. In the most propitious of cases, where there is a basic convergence of goals (of the teaching and research aims), adjustments are not automatic and the system's efficiency depends on the ingenuity which they display. In less favourable cases (co-existence of the goals of general culture and specialised knowledge), an awareness of the necessity for compromise is no less indispensible. Where there are real contradictions (as between the concern to provide a wide cultural background and the aim of economic utility in tertiary education), idealistic or purely hit-and-miss solutions are likely to be very disappointing.

When one considers the history of Southern European countries in the last two decades it becomes apparent that these limitations and unavoidable choices have been felt to some extent, but the awareness has been as it were deadened either by fear of innovation or by exaggeration of its potential effects, or even simply by political and social resistance to an honest rationalising of the options.

All things considered, it must be accepted that it is for each state, according to its own criteria and in the light of its own problems, to establish what volume of resources it can make available, now and in the medium-term, for its education system. Allocation of funds to various institutions or among various goals should be undertaken in the light of the educational system as a whole, not as a result of a purely haphazard distribution amongst the bodies asking for them.

A plan for restructuring and developing tertiary education can be worked out again for the medium-term, within this double overall framework (the share of the education system's needs in proportion to national needs as a whole, and the tertiary education share within the general education system). This plan will call for compromises or decisions at each stage.

The efficiency of tertiary education in relation to the aims which seem to be generally accepted will therefore depend on a clear view of the limitations on choices, on a precise medium-term strategy and on forceful decisions when conciliation fails.

## CHAPTER III

## STRUCTURES

In this chapter, three issues are given critical consideration:

- the place of tertiary education in the education system as a whole;
- the components of tertiary education;
- the administration of tertiary education.

### SECTION I - The place of tertiary education in the education system as a whole

27. When one examines recent developments in the countries of Southern Europe in regard to the place of tertiary education in the education system as a whole, three features stand out clearly.

Firstly, the education system as such is being regarded more and more as a single entity, and tertiary education as a firmly integrated sub-system.

Secondly, the goals of the education system as a whole are complex and occasionally ambiguous.

Thirdly, the function of pre-tertiary education (and sometimes of para-tertiary education as well) is partly to provide incentive and guidance for students entering the tertiary education sector and partly to discourage excessive intake.

28. The first feature is an obvious one. Clearly, there have always been links between the components of education systems, not least with regard to the relations between the three levels traditionally known as primary, secondary and higher. And attempts have certainly been made to incorporate the new elements such as the nursery school (pre-school) and "practical" vocational or technical education. But these links obeyed no strict rule and grew out of the ideas that each of the educational "orders" had of its own objectives rather than out of any theory regarding the overall goal of the education system.

If endeavours to achieve integration have gone forward in all the countries under review, the causes were the same in each case; it will be sufficient simply to mention these without further explanation:

- The provision of primary education for everyone robbed secondary education of its élite-only character and established a strong link between the two. In the same way, mass secondary education now raises the question of links with tertiary education in terms of much larger numbers.
- The increasing technical complexity of economic systems has turned education into a vehicle of economic development, the latter having become a major objective of every society.

important in comparison with that of private or local educational establishments, its opportunities for applying this new skill increase.

Consequently, higher education - or tertiary education as it has become - cannot be discussed in isolation. While its administration may be compatible with a degree of autonomy or decentralisation, its structure is becoming more and more centralised with reference to the education system as a whole. This tendency is illustrated in each of the national reports and is showing no sign of reversal.

29. The second noteworthy feature is both a consequence and an illustration of the first. A survey of the goals of the education system as a whole and for each of its parts would, if compared with the findings set out in the previous chapter (paragraph 15) for tertiary education, reveal that the only differences are differences of level. Does tertiary education differ in its aims from the other components of the education system and from the system as a whole? In one respect only; the conquest of new knowledge - in other words, research - is exclusive to the tertiary sector (although not by any means a university monopoly). This is a difference of level based on the fact that the conquest of new knowledge is open only to persons with a certain educational background. Basically, however, the aims are shared; this applies particularly to the twofold goal of individual accomplishment and social integration.

In case anyone is wondering whether it could ever have been otherwise, the answer is simple. Not so long ago the various educational "orders" pursued fundamentally different aims, and each was concerned to train a particular type of man. First-degree education (reading, writing, arithmetic and civics) was designed to turn out worker-citizens qualified for manual occupations and trained in the use of the ballot paper; secondary education was for "gentlemen" and provided society and the economy with middle-range executives; higher education was for the training of teachers, academics and members of the "learned" professions. So much so, that bourgeois-democrat literature in the period around 1900 or 1920 depicted the generations as stages on the way to social advancement through education, each generation producing a type of man "superior" to that of the previous generation, in a carefully ordered progression: the son of a farmer or worker would become a schoolteacher, accountant or army officer; the grandson a doctor, lawyer or university professor.

That these modest designs bound by considerations of rank are being superseded by an overall and more egalitarian design, substituting a strategy of social function for the strategy of social status, is certainly all to the good.

The quid pro quo of the general integration of the education system is, of course, that some of the conflicting aims mentioned earlier in connection with tertiary education recur in the context of the total education system. An illustration of this is the argument opposing individual demand and social need. If the problems of selection and guidance place tertiary education under severe strain, that strain is greater still at pre-tertiary level, understandably so because the crossroads that children and young people reach while at school or at the lycée are - or seem to be -

This is not intended to be a study of the tensions and difficulties inherent in total education systems; tertiary education is a large enough field in itself. However, the general ideas expressed above call for two further remarks.

The first is that the reports and diagrams relating to various countries' education systems give an overwhelming impression of complexity; and the multitude of reforms that are tried suggests instability. Of course, complexity and instability are not the result of wrong policies but simply highlight the intrinsic difficulty of the issue and the fact that much of the work being done in the countries concerned is still experimental.

The second remark is more factual: there is, it seems, a tendency to create a distinction at government level between the Ministry of Education and the Ministry for University Affairs. This has been the case in France for some years, and in Spain for the past year. Elsewhere the tendency seems to be for the Minister of Education to be assisted by a junior Minister (Secretary of State) for the universities.

What is the meaning of this trend that seems to contradict our findings with regard to the increasing integration of the components of the education system? Should it be encouraged? Does it not jeopardise the conceptual unity of the education system?

In fact the answer should be given from a functional rather than an organic standpoint, and be set in relation to the political and administrative system of each country under review. In a system where the executive and the administration are tightly structured under the firm direction of the Prime Minister or head of state, the creation of two ministries may simply be a means of sharing the work-load, and in no way imperil the unity of the education system. The looser the management structure becomes, the greater, obviously, will be the danger of incoherence.

If there is a recommendation to be made, it would be concerned less with the principle of unity or duality in the running of the education system than with the existence of a single centre for conception and construction.

30. The third feature resulting from consideration of the countries of Southern Europe concerns the ambivalent role of pre-tertiary education in regard to intake at the tertiary level.

The chief purpose of pre-tertiary education is to supply the tertiary sector with students: not simply students of a certain age and a certain educational background, but students who have already received some guidance. This is a point on which the countries under review all agree. Initiation and even training are available at the end of the pre-tertiary stage in subjects which were formerly the preserve of the faculties (law, management, economics, biology, arts etc). There is also a tendency when setting the criteria for admission to tertiary education (see below, paragraph 63) and directing students to one or other avenue, to take account of

special abilities and qualifications acquired at the pre-tertiary stage. Pre-tertiary diversification is preparatory to diversification at tertiary level.

But at the same time, pre-tertiary education helps to steer students away from tertiary education. The forms of technical, practical and vocational training that it offers enable numerous students to enter jobs directly rather than crowd around the entrance to the universities or equivalent establishments - although they may have to do so later if they choose to continue their training. The same applies to "para-tertiary" education, if the term is used to refer to certain extended forms of vocational training that do not have the prestige of the university and associated sectors.

31. The problem of access to tertiary education and the possible role of the criteria drawn from pre-tertiary education will be discussed later.

But even at this stage, there is one recommendation that may be envisaged: it is that courses of pre-tertiary education should never be designed to cut students off completely from the tertiary sector. In other words, while it is admissible for pre-tertiary courses to qualify someone for tertiary education, they should never disqualify anyone. "Deterrence" is legitimate in so far as its purpose is to persuade (why embark on higher studies if pre-tertiary studies afford interesting employment prospects?) but not if it makes for arbitrary discrimination (one cannot refuse someone a university education on the grounds that he has "found his feet" at pre-tertiary level).

SECTION II - Universities, colleges and tertiary education

32. In all the countries of Southern Europe, the question has arisen of the place to be allotted to the various types of tertiary education, and the relationships to be established between them; for the sake of simplicity and at the risk of being over-schematic, this study will be confined to two types only: universities and colleges ("écoles").

Roughly speaking, universities have five distinguishing features: a status conferring a varying degree of autonomy, a full-time staff of teachers to whom special guarantees are offered, large numbers of students who are not required to compete even when admission is controlled, a curriculum which includes a high proportion of private study, no establishment-based graduate employment service.

The five distinguishing features of colleges are diametrically opposite to these: they are run on more hierarchical and less autonomous lines; many of the teaching staff are recruited from other professions and do not have university status where guarantees are concerned; students are admitted by competitive examination and continue to compete during their courses; teaching methods are more "directive" and involve a high proportion of classwork; and a liaison is established (very often with the help of former pupils) between colleges and employers (many colleges actually find employment for their students).

This is, of course, only a very simplified schema. There are numerous slight differences between one country and another. Also, in addition to the two types described briefly above, there are intermediate types.

Even so, the problem of the place, roles and mutual relations of the two types of institution is a very real one in all of the countries under review.

33. If we try to classify the various systems practised in Southern Europe according to type, France must be regarded as belonging to a category of its own, since the situation there is that two systems of tertiary education exist side by side: the universities and colleges ("grandes écoles" and "écoles spécialisées") stand in contrast to each other by reason of the characteristics listed earlier. Far from receding, this fact of traditional life is becoming accentuated. The system of "écoles" in the past consisted chiefly of institutes of a very high standard; by public, corporate and private initiatives a number of schools of medium standard have been added, and these have all been officially recognised at some time or other. The tendency is encouraged by the consistently bad image of the university among the public and by the fact that employment opportunities are incomparably (or appreciably) better for people educated in the non-university than in the univeristy sector. Tertiary education in France can be described as a dual system, the non-university branch being the selective and prestigious one.

Continuing this classification attempt, the term unitary should be used to refer to the systems in which the contrasts between the university and non-university sector are only very slight - or in any case less marked than in France. But there is considerable variety within this unitary category.

There are unitary systems in which the university model is definitely paramount and confers its prestige on the subordinate institutes that are attached to it. This seems to be the case in Spain and Italy.

In other countries, however, there are semi-unitary (or semi-dual) systems in which the non-university sector, although not cut off from the university is nevertheless strongly differentiated. This is the case, for example, in Portugal where the university is itself subject to inner differentiation with the system of "new universities" and is flanked by short-term colleges of higher education which are one of the outstanding features of the reform of tertiary higher education and stand in marked contrast to the universities (especially the ancient ones) in regard to student admission, teaching staff and teaching methods. The same could probably be said of Turkey, although there legislation is in preparation to give university status to the (at present) non-university "academies".

34. In fact, national characteristics are such that, apart from the clear-cut situation in France, this can only be a rough classification, especially as the administrative structure of the various forms of tertiary education matters less than their political and social status. In France, the "grandes écoles" owe their impact chiefly to

three factors: they enable people educated there to gain access to the most highly qualified posts at the top levels of management; they "cream off" large numbers of the best students from the universities; and they tend to resist reform more effectively than the universities precisely because their former pupils, being imbued (not surprisingly) with the benefits of their educational background and occupying key positions in the state administration, are quite ready to reform the university system which they know nothing about and consider inferior, but prefer the "grandes écoles" system in which they were brought up to be left alone. On the other hand, where the university model is paramount, new institutions are required to imitate that model if they wish to be recognised and enjoy its prestige. In other words, as might be expected, a unitary system will foster the unitary principle, and a dual system the dual principle.

And yet, paradoxically, the capacity of the tertiary education system to undergo change has weakened in both cases for reasons which are different although their effects are similar. In the case of French dual system, it is because the state authorities may well advocate change in the university despite the latter's built-in resistance, but will wish the "grandes écoles" sector to remain unchanged. Thus, endeavours to reform and transform the tertiary education system concentrate on its largest component (in numerical terms) and not on the dual structure itself. True, one should not regard the "écoles" as institutions irredeemably set in their ways: on the contrary, many of them have made far-reaching changes in their curricula (with more variety through the introduction of non-technical subjects) or have adopted less "school-type" teaching methods. But the élite character of the "grandes écoles" is permanent: the number of pupils admitted to any one of them has scarcely gone up, and any increase in the total number of pupils in the sector is due solely to the founding of new schools.

However, even where tertiary education is dominated by the universities, its capacity for change is no greater. Universities are institutions with a definite predilection for certain traditions and usually a strong built-in resistance to the type of diversification that involves giving tertiary education utilitarian aims and recruiting experts or professionals as teachers. When universities dominate the tertiary education scene, any new institution has to choose between imitating a university and having university prestige, or sacrificing prestige in return for the privilege of retaining its own identity.

The inability of both models, dual and unitary, to affect the capacity for change is not as paradoxical as it may seem: any reform grafted on the existing institutions inevitably comes up against inertia and an instinct for self-preservation. The structure of the "establishment" differs from one model to the other, but every "establishment" is conservative.

This may explain the role conferred on the "new universities" in some countries (Greece, Portugal, Italy). It could be seen as a "trick" to escape the change-resistant forces engendered by the "establishment", whether dual or unitary. The countries concerned are those where higher education is by tradition identified with university education but where plans are being made to develop non-university tertiary education, if possible without creating a dual structure as a result. There is a risk, as mentioned earlier, of the new institutions set up under the aegis of the universities either merging with the universities or losing some of their prestige.

Thus the new universities are apparently expected to meet a whole range of related needs:

- firstly, to stimulate innovation within the university system itself, partly by working in areas that formerly received little or no attention, and partly through their choice of teaching methods, location etc (direct effect);

- secondly, to break down or weaken the establishment's resistance to change and make the university system more amenable to the introduction of non-university institutions of a new type (indirect or secondary effect).

35. There is no issue on which recommendations are more difficult to formulate than this one.

Doubtless the ideal is clear. If, as we have seen, integration of tertiary education in a total education system is urgently needed, then it goes without saying that the various components of tertiary education must also be integrated. Integration does not, of course, mean uniformity, and the aim is not to create a monolith in which diversification would have no place. There are three essentials: a clear view of the common objective and of the distribution of functions within tertiary education; a political and social status that would not make for unreasonable inequalities between one institute and another or between the persons educated there; and links between these institutes enabling them to co-operate in fields such as research, interdisciplinary study, permanent education etc.

If one could start from scratch in the countries under review, it would be easy to incorporate this ideal in a recommendation. But we are dealing with existing structures of various kinds that are both involved and change-resistant; the difficulty lies, as always in such cases, partly in marking out a line of reform in which more will be improved than destroyed, and partly in judging whether the gains are likely to outweigh the losses. As Bernard Shaw said to the lady who suggested they should have a child endowed with its father's intelligence and its mother's beauty: "And what, madam, if it had my beauty and your intelligence?".

This is the question that many French people are asking. Although not blindly enamoured of the "écoles" system, they are wondering what would be the result of a unification or at least a harmonisation of the university and non-university institutions making up their tertiary education sector: "What if each of the two types of institution were to assume the least desirable characteristics of the other?". Similarly, in countries where the major role in culture and the training of society's leaders has devolved upon the universities, an innovation too far removed from the university model or at least the university's inspiration would not take root easily. One does not abolish or invent institutions as easily as one drafts an act or a decree. There would seem to be no way of formulating recommendations laying down a uniform procedure for achieving the three-point ideal set out above. Rather than prescribe medicine or surgery, one should perhaps offer advice on "hygiene":

- never set up an institute of tertiary education, or allow one to continue, without linking it to the total tertiary education system and without associating it with the general aims of the latter; this means that:

  - there must be a decision-making centre within the political and administrative system that can intervene when measures are required affecting the objectives, values and general resources made available to tertiary education;

  - there must be continuing consultation between tertiary education establishments of all categories, not least through the medium of councils covering these categories at the various levels (national, regional and possibly local);

  - reasonable communication must be established between teachers in institutions of both categories;

  - courses must be designed to permit two-way transit by students;

  - there must be co-operation in matters of research.

## SECTION III - The administration of tertiary education and its institutions

36. At the present time in the countries under review, the administration of tertiary education raises two essential problems; that of autonomy and that of participation.

### A. Autonomy

37. For a long time, the tertiary education system consisted chiefly of the universities or faculties. These institutions were celebrated for the independence enjoyed by their teaching staff - far greater than that of civil servants or employees generally - and for their autonomy; the latter might vary in degree but was always real in

practice and in law and was usually evidenced by the existence of councils with various names having decision-making powers and elected officers. This was the German model which was said to have exercised a certain influence in numerous countries of Southern Europe. The Napoleonic model itself, although theoretically standing for centralisation with authority vested in the state, evolved towards a form of de facto autonomy. Although this pattern was disturbed from time to time when non-democratic regimes came to power in one country or another, the members of the university, whether professors or students, regarded such upsets as historical accidents which would all come right again when the accident (ie dictatorship) ended.

How can autonomy be regarded as a problem at a time when the whole of Southern Europe is blessed with democratic institutions?

It is a problem, nevertheless, for a number of very tangible reasons.

The first is that, while the institutions of tertiary education can and should have autonomy, the government must retain control of the tertiary education sector as a whole because the government is responsible for determining aims, providing the financial and other resources, and organising the distribution of functions both within the tertiary education sector and within the education system of which that sector is a part.

The second reason is that tertiary education annexed or created establishments which, while not sharing in the university tradition, became virtually of their own accord part of the administrative and pedagogical hierarchy that operated in the other branches of the educational system, so that for them, autonomy is an innovation.

Lastly, in all the countries under review, every reform in tertiary education has been the result of a decision by the political leadership, even if incentives and support came from a section of the university's membership. Hence the natural tendency for the public authorities not to concede too great a degree of autonomy for fear that their reform moves might be slowed down, distorted or diverted.

It is true that some new arguments for granting autonomy to the higher education institutes came, in retrospect, to be added to the traditional ones (research is fruitful only if free; the standard and nature of the knowledge to be dispensed cannot be reconciled with a hierarchical system etc): it was found that diversification, one of the key words of the reform movement, would have been jeopardised by administrative or pedagogical centralisation; that the massive development of tertiary education spawned so many units as to render centralised management less and less feasible on technical grounds; and that university autonomy was a precondition for the restoration or development of democracy.

38. The problem of autonomy was and continues to be stated in terms which are too general and lack the necessary distinctions - a criticism which can incidentally be made of the foregoing paragraphs.

It is linked, but not to be confused, with two other questions: that of the independence of the teaching staff and that of centralisation. Although these three problem areas overlap to some extent, their boundaries are not strictly identical.

The independence of the teaching staff is essential to higher education and research, and not just for ethical reasons: independence is essential to efficiency. On the teaching side, the standard of recruitment would be low indeed if staff were required to recite a political or scientific creed. On the research side, objectives, hypotheses and working methods must be freely chosen if discoveries are to be made. In fact, in countries where there is an official philosophy or ideology, one finds that even if teachers and research workers are required to affect token allegiance, the best results come from laboratory work in fields where the ideology does not really intrude; whereas in the human sciences and other fields where the ideological axioms are imposed, the results are less brilliant. The independence of teaching and research staff in tertiary education is therefore an ethical and a practical necessity.

Be that as it may, autonomy is neither the precondition nor the inevitable consequence of independence, for the very good reason that autonomy is a way of practising collective self-government while independence means not being governed individually. This does not mean that independent men are not to be found in autonomous universities. But there can be independent staff in non-autonomous establishments provided that the administrative bodies that run them are required in practice and by law not to interfere with the teachers' freedom to hold opinions and organise their own work. Conversely, autonomy is no guarantee of staff freedom: a teacher's freedom may be seriously threatened by harrassment (examples are known) if the university is politicised or given over to local intrigue, or simply if a majority of colleagues are hostile to the development of a particular branch of science or a particular conception of teaching. There may also be cases of non-autonomous establishments where the teachers are not independent, but we need not mention those.

This does not mean that autonomy, one of the traditional features of university teaching, can be thrown overboard without closer consideration. It would be morally regrettable and, in many cases, actually harmful. The above analysis simply sets out to show that autonomy must be discussed as a subject in its own right and not with reference to staff independence, sometimes referred to as "academic freedom".

It could also be shown - but this is more surprising and less important - that autonomy is not necessarily incompatible with centralisation, provided the point of application is shifted. Centralisation is concerned with the centre of power; autonomy is concerned with whether power is exerted from outside or inside the system in question. It is therefore conceivable that if the various institutes of higher education were governed by a sort of national university senate or by central councils with competence in each discipline, comprising members elected by the teaching staff, one would have centralisation and autonomy side by side. This was the situation in the French faculties before 1968. Centralisation took the form of national curricula, uniform regulations for diplomas, and careers managed by the central authority etc. Little by little, however, that authority passed in its entirety from the ministry to the elected councils which, although nominally consultative, took decisions on recruitment and promotion and the organisation of courses, to which the minister simply applied his rubber stamp.

As a rule, however (since 1968 in the case of France) autonomy is seen as being concomitant with decentralisation and therefore applicable to the universities.

39. If autonomy is regarded, for the reasons mentioned earlier, as being applicable to institutes of tertiary education, and justified on its own grounds, where do the countries of Southern Europe stand in this respect?

The answer can be contained in three statements:

- autonomy is a basic principle of university organisation in all the countries under review, though with differences of degree between one country and another;

- it is, however, restricted by the role devolving upon the government and administrative authority, chiefly over the allocation of resources and also over course regulations and career structures;

- the concept of autonomy carries much less weight in the non-university sector of tertiary education.

These three points call for comment.

40. University autonomy is proclaimed as a principle in nearly all countries. In Turkey, Greece and Italy, the guarantee is particularly firm in that it is written into the Constitution. Elsewhere the guarantee is embodied in legislation only.

Autonomy comprises certain minimum essentials, a "common core" as it were. They are: recognition of the institute as a legal entity, having its own estate; facilities for electing or proposing some if not all of its governors and administrators; some discretion in the use of appropriations; freedom to establish research aims within certain limits; disciplinary powers in respect of teachers and students; and participation in teacher recruitment procedures (in the case of those universities which are not free to recruit whom they please).

But apart from this common core, there exists numerous variants which add to or detract from the total degree of autonomy.

Autonomy extends further in some countries than in others. We have seen that in some cases, certain bodies cannot consist wholly of elected representatives; the system of student admission may or may not be regulated by the central authority; diplomas and teaching methods may or may not be subject to general regulations etc.

A further factor must be taken into account, namely the organisation and role of what may be called the university's internal "subdivisions": faculties, departments, institutes, teaching and research units, depending on the terminology employed. These may be interconnected in one of three ways according to how powers are shared between the university and its components: a confederal system where the university is barely more than a meeting of faculties which constitute the real decision-making centres (this was the case in France in 1968 and is still the case with certain largely interdisciplinary universities as in Italy; it is the case in Spain to a lesser degree and in Greece where the traditional universities are concerned); a federal system (generally corresponding to the use of the term "department") where powers are shared by the university and its components (as in the new universities, for example); and a unitary system which occurs where narrow specialisation reduces the status of the university's components to that of sub-disciplines.

41. However, even with the maximum degree of autonomy, there are always limits.

Firstly, there are legal restrictions. The state alone is sovereign. Universities are therefore always subject to constitutional rules and legislation, and the legality of the decisions of university authorities are therefore subject to administrative or judicial control.

But in addition, in all the countries under review, the universities' resources are of budgetary origin. University autonomy is therefore inevitably restricted by the public authorities' assessment of their needs. True, the example of Turkey, where the universities' budgets are fixed and their accounts audited directly by parliament and not by any ministry, shows that the overall assessment of the universities' needs by external bodies can be accompanied by guarantees regarding the free use of funds; but in practice, if not in law, appropriations are invariably granted only after the universities have stated how they intend to use the funds. The techniques of budgeting and auditing can restrict this freedom still further.

In a number of countries (most of them, in fact) "nationwide" career structures have been instituted at the teachers' request (see Part IV); this sytem, which most teachers favour strongly for the guarantee it provides against political, corporate or local favouritism, places a corresponding restriction on the universities' autonomy in matters of recruitment.

Also, there are national regulations covering some or all of the courses and diplomas.

All in all, autonomy is a relative and variable concept.

42. If the autonomy principle extends to most universities, the same is not true of the non-university institutes. This is understandable because autonomy is one of the university system's design criteria (see above, paragraph 32).

The way diversification operates is of vital importance here although no national types can be identified.

Diversification has been achieved in part by broadening the objectives of the traditional universities, the new universities and the former non-university institutes now having university status, and setting up new courses. In this way diversification has increased the scope of autonomy.

But another aspect of diversification has been the promotion or creation of non-university institutes. Clearly, the governments feared that university status would make it too tempting for these institutes to deviate from the objectives laid down, and the link with the state authorities remained fairly close. In practically no country of Southern Europe has the autonomy principle been applied to the whole of the tertiary education sector.

43. On the question of recommendations to be made in regard to the autonomy of the institutions of tertiary education, the above considerations suggest that the following ideas might usefully be incorporated:

- It would be a retrograde step to abolish the principle of university autonomy. Such autonomy must rest on a combination of freely elected governing or administrative bodies and control of the legality of their decisions by or under the supervision of the courts.

- The state must of course remain in charge and lay down the general objectives of the university system and the volume of resources to place at its disposal; it must also act as co-ordinator. But its relations with the universities should be based on a concerted approach and not authoritarian management procedures. For example, inter-university relations, in particular where co-ordination is concerned, should be entrusted as they are in most countries, to one or more councils bringing together the representatives of the universities, those of public authorities and those of the major national industries.

Similarly, there should be - and this, unfortunately, is a less widespread practice - a system of contractual charters or programme contracts between the state and a particular university defining new objectives and guaranteeing the resources for carrying through this or that innovation in research, course material or teaching method.

- With regard to the non-university sector, while it is permissible for autonomy not to be granted for the necessary experimental or inaugural period, there are no permanent grounds for denying autonomy to all non-university establishments of tertiary education. This does not mean that they should be structured in exactly the same way as universities; it means that the minimum autonomy defined above (paragraph 40) should be accorded. In other words, the diversification of tertiary education must, in so far as it is successful, be conducive to autonomy for the institutions at the highest level in that sector and not just for the universities.

B. Participation

44. University self-government used to be the prerogative of the teaching staff, especially those of the most senior rank. One of the most consistent features of university reform in recent times has been to extend participation in self-government to:

- teaching staff of other categories (assistant profesors, "maîtres-assistants", "assistants" etc);

- students;

- members of the administrative staff (employees or workmen);

- personalities outside the university.

It was not unknown for one or other of these categories to be represented, even before the wave of reform that began ten years ago; they now participate more fully.

45. The situation in the countries of Southern Europe presents a formidably complex picture. Although the monopoly, or virtual monopoly, formerly enjoyed by staff of the most senior rank is now a thing of the past, the formula now varies very widely from country to country. The categories from which the new participants are drawn are not the same in each case, even though junior teaching staff and students are as a rule represented. The organs of participation vary in their membership and in their powers. Furthermore, not all categories are equally represented in each country. The extreme cases seem to be France, where heads of department account for only about 30% of the membership of university and UER councils (1), and Turkey where they are very much in the majority. It must also be borne in mind that in some countries (for example, Spain) reforms in this respect are either very recent or still pending.

---

(1) UER = Unité d'enseignement et de recherche (teaching and research unit).

Generally, however, participation is confined to two fields: the first is that of staff recruitment and promotion, where decisions are taken as a rule by a panel consisting entirely of teachers of a rank equivalent to that of the vacant post; the second is research, here decisions are made by bodies whose members are all or very nearly *all scientifically qualified*.

46. Although the practice of enlisting the services of persons other than top-ranking teaching staff in the running of the university is usually referred to simply as "participation", the motives are by no means the same in every case:

- Teaching staff below the rank of head of department are given a place simply because they carry out an increasingly wide-range of teaching duties and because their teaching and scientific ability, although less proven than that of their more senior colleagues, is undeniable. Exactly what proportion of influence they should have could be a matter for debate, and may in fact vary according to the nature of the decisions to be taken.

- Where students are concerned the reasons are of a different order and not without ambiguity. From the standpoint of tradition, and perhaps of myth, student participation may be explained as a return to the mediaeval "universitas", a community of teachers and disciples. In modern terms the explanation may be that of a public service must be managed by an association of operators and users, according to the theory of self-management.

- The participation of administrative staff (employees and workmen) is consistent with the logic of a self-managed public service, but added to this is the idea that duties performed in the public service cannot be hierarchically graded and that self-management is open to all members of the working community.

- Lastly, the presence of persons outside the university in the university councils is in many cases a long-standing tradition, its purpose being to give the university a place in national or local life through the medium of public figures. According to modern thinking, students are the direct and temporary users of tertiary education, while society is the final and permanent user and must therefore be represented in the decision-making organs.

47. It is very difficult to give a considered opinion on participation in general, and equally difficult to make recommendations.

In the first place, one should have no illusions about the effects which opinions and recommendations are likely to produce. All the problems of teaching in general, and tertiary education in particular, are largely political; that of participation, however, is almost wholly political and is treated as such by parliaments, governments

and the general public. Whereas the opinion of experts on questions other than participation can be expected to exert some influence, an opinion on participation will carry no weight whatsoever. It will always be seen as politically biased by those that do not like it and any technical validity it may be acknowledge to have will soon be swept aside on political grounds.

Secondly, a view should be expressed on the validity of the "arguments" for participation. It could well be acknowledged, and we have done so, that the argument for the participation of teaching staff below the most senior ranks is conclusive and that only the effects remain to be measured and controlled. On the other hand, the other "arguments" could be strongly opposed. Some people may ask why a university, whose management demands expert ability of a high standard, should be regarded as a public service to be run partly by its users, who are, incidentally, only passing through? You can travel by train or drive on the roads for your whole life without ever becoming a member of the board of directors of the railway company or a member of the Highways Department; and yet people feel qualified to run a university simply because they enrol there once a year. Why? The answer would probably be one of a series of arguments: that every learner is a teacher (and must have the same rights as teachers); that the highest sector of the education system must take the lead and keep ahead of developments in other sectors of society etc. The other "reasons" mentioned briefly above could equally well be attacked or defended.

It may be that the most reliable basis for assessment would be found by experiment. Briefly, one can say that participation in university management has produced very few desirable results and a large number of results that are anything but desirable. Few examples of constructive and novel ideas put forward by non-teachers have been forthcoming except where outside personalities are concerned (1). It is not that the categories in question are intellectually backward, but that they do not have the right qualifications to govern a scientific community. In addition, and by way of explanation, the student representation system has nearly always been commandeered by extremist political groups since these comprise the only active and motivated members of a largely apathetic student body as far as participation is concerned. The result is not simply politics in the universities (that is an age-old phenomenon) but a politicised University. This is a new curse and it is as much a threat to the universities' autonomy, goals and scientific objectivity as any government stranglehold (and perhaps more so).

But not everybody would agree with this picture of recent experience. It will be labelled partial and one-sided Above all it will be accused of failing to take account of the fact that participation, like any other democratic institution, needs time to mature. No fruit can be judged by the first crop, and a little faith is required so as not to block the way ahead.

---

(1) This idea has been strongly contested but it has not been possible to give an example supporting the contestation. The Rapporteur therefore maintains this phrase.

48. There can ...erefore be no question of disparaging the principle of participation in a report and still less in a recommendation. At most, to use a term and a method employed earlier (paragraph 35) one might formulate a series of reminders on "hygiene" where participation is concerned:

- Without being misled by slogans of equality or parity, teaching staff must retain majority representation in the organs of university government with due regard to their permanence and scientific competence. This is a condition both of effective government and of the existence of genuine scientific communities, because any system run on contrary lines will in the end make teachers exiles in their own house.

- Students must be able to make their views heard. However, the first problem that arises is that of the proportion of student representatives in the university bodies; also, it would surely be right for former students who left the university in the not-too-distant past (say ten years at most) to be represented as well, and bring their practical experience to bear on such questions as student guidance, diplomas and employment prospects.

- Where the universities offer decisions or opinions on appointments and careers, arrangements must be made (and rules for this in fact exist) to ensure that only teachers of the rank concerned are involved. Similarly, only scientifically qualified persons would be eligible to decide on matters concerning research.

- As a corollary to the above, it might be suggested that the membership and powers of assemblies, councils, commissions etc be made to vary according to the subject under discussion. For example, it might be perfectly feasible for certain questions of a social nature (relief fund, job-seeking service, leisure occupations etc) to be entrusted to a body comprising a majority of students.

## CHAPTER IV

## THE HUMAN FACTOR

49. Although the human factor in tertiary education amounts to more than just *teaching staff and students*, these are the two main categories. They are considered separately in the two sections of this chapter.

### SECTION I - The teaching staff

50. In few particulars - with the possible exception of the student body - do the countries of Southern Europe present such striking similarities. These can be summed up in two points: starting in the sixties - or slightly later in some countries - the traditional pattern whereby the teaching body was composed of few members, mostly of elevated status, was altered by unplanned if not uncontrolled growth and diversification; in more recent times efforts have been or are being made to rationalise the status of teachers and sort out the problems arising out of the preceding confusion.

51. In most countries it was traditional for the major part of a university's teaching staff (in qualitative as well as numerical terms) to consist of "professors", with - in some countries - small differences of status within certain disciplines to set the more senior members slightly apart from the others.

Over the past ten or twenty years, this pattern has been disturbed in all countries and on nearly all fronts.

Firstly - and this is the least recent feature - the traditional teaching body of professional rank grew in number and diversified partly in response to increasing student numbers and partly in order to cover the new scientific and other subjects resulting from academic diversification.

Subsequently and for the same reasons, teachers from other sectors (government, industry and the professions) were employed in the universities in addition to the full-time teachers with the traditional training; many of them combined with some other occupation.

Lastly, the ranks in the university hierarchy became more numerous and were given various names. Below the full professors and those aspiring to that rank, teachers of lower status were recruited. These appointments were either permanent with attendant problems of careers and promotions, or non-permanent, in which case the problems were more formidable still in nearly every country.

The end result was that total membership of the teaching body increased three, five or ten times, and in some countries and some disciplines even more. It was a mass teaching force to match the mass university.

But the changes described above, and in particular those leading to category differentiation and large-scale staff recruitment, are not attributable simply to the increase in student numbers and the diversification of course content. A further factor was that as

52. The resulting problems might have been less numerous if such profound changes had not been made under pressure of circumstances but in obedience to a general development plan. Some of the problems soon became evident (for example that of the assistants, about which more later); others were less perceptible and emerged only gradually. These may now be reviewed briefly.

First there was a change in the general climate of the universities. A whole range of teachers came between the professors and the students, making for a closer teacher-learner relationship but also building a screen between the student and the supposed specialist. Gradually, the old-fashioned hierarchy whereby teachers and students were face to face was superseded by a far more graded hierarchy (the effects were felt particulalrly in the faculties of arts, law and economics where there is less laboratory teamwork than in other disciplines). The universities assumed certain well-known features of administrative sociology: one of these was the demand for guaranteed or, better still, automatic promotion according to a system based on seniority and loyalty rather than on the attainment of higher scientific qualifications. The lower ranks of the hierarchy took much less interest than did the traditional professors in the guarantees inherent in university status, and preferred the advantages of non-specific civil service status with continuous problem-free career structures.

The psycho-sociological situation thus created might have generated less tension and fewer problems had it not been complicated by two further difficulties due to the failure of the control machinery operated by the state. Partly because it was thought that public spending should be cut, and partly because teachers of the highest standard could not be found quickly enough, the university employment pyramid tapered out considerably: the number of jobs with the rank of professor became smaller with the result that even if they acquired the necessary qualifications, many other teachers lost all hopes of chairs or equivalent posts being offered to them; at best, they would have had to wait many years. Also - to mention another side to the same question - the improvised and unplanned way in which posts were created on a day-to-day basis to meet momentary needs led to blockages and bottlenecks. In the periods of rapid growth in demand - the years following 1968 in the case of France - the pace of recruitment was stepped up. On the other hand, when the slowing down of demand means that teachers have to mark time in anticipation of higher posts, while students who have undergone lengthy preparation for university careers find the entrance blocked, the less-advanced students are discouraged from undertaking preparatory training. To understand this situation, it is sufficient to make a comparison with heavy industry (for example aircraft construction or nuclear development) and imagine the confusion that would set in, and the losses that would be sustained if a firm's facilities for a fifteen-year production programme were installed and extended on a day-to-day basis without reference to a plan. Phenomena similar to those affecting the "production" of the university teaching body would inevitably occur: the production lines would become dislocated and break down; there would be a surplus here and a deficit there; and the makeshift equipment would be of poor quality and obsolescent.

Moreover, this lack of planning would normally result in a profusion of unconnected special-status arrangements and a real nightmare for staff management.

53. Of all the problems that occur in this way, one must be singled out because it is shared to some degree by nearly all countries and because it has assumed political significance nearly everywhere. This is the problem of the assistants.

In general, the recruitment of assistants has gone forward for two purposes regarded as complementary: firstly, to meet the demand for new teachers; secondly, to give financial resources to students of a high standard wishing to take up university careers on a permanent basis. The general idea was that advanced students should undertake teaching duties in return for suitable remuneration, but have the necessary free time to prepare doctoral theses or otherwise improve their scientific qualifications. The assistant's status was by definition provisional: either he obtained a scientific qualification and became a permanent teacher - in the normal course of events - or he neither acquired the qualification nor became a member of the established university staff, in which case he resigned after a certain number of years of duty. An assistant's status was one-third teacher, one-third trainee probationer and one-third scholarship holder.

But this design which is apparently logical and did not in fact - at least not everywhere - give cause for dissatisfaction in the early days got out of order for reasons which differed from country to country and from discipline to discipline. At first there proved to be too few permanent posts for the number of assistants queueing up for them, even with all the required qualifications. At the same time, the massive recruitment drives that had gone on to meet the sudden increase in demand for assistants opened the teachers' ranks to students of inferior standard without the ability to improve what qualifications they had. Also, it was not unusual for the assistants themselves to abuse the system, for instance by combining their assistants' duties with some other occupation in order to earn a comfortable living; they did so at the expense of the free time required for preparing the doctoral thesis.

Theoretically, the remedy should have been found in the regulations governing assistantship which laid down the alternative: a higher post in the permanent establishment, or resignation from the university. But attempts to apply this rule very often came up against implacable resistance. There were cases where an assistant's failure to attain a higher post had nothing to do with his lack of scientific qualifications but only with the lack of available posts. Furthermore, the assistants were very effectively organised, and used powerful weapons in suport of their demand for permanent employment (not to mention promotion and seniority): strikes, whose impact was proportional to the volume of university teaching undertaken by the assistants; support from political parties and trade unions; liaison with students in the name of youth solidarity despite the fact that extending an assistant's term of duty meant depriving his successor of a post.

Just as the authorities had been unable to plan and control the recruitment of the teaching body as a whole, so they now had to give further thought to the problem of the assistants; firm statements to the effect that the rules would be applied alternated with promises to meet the demand for more stable employment.

It goes without saying that the economic crisis aggravated the difficulties just described, not least by making the assistants keener than ever to achieve guaranteed employment.

54. The need to restore order to administrative model too complicated even for the administrators; the need to adapt teacher status to the new conditions (mass education and diversification); and the knowledge that problems such as the careers of junior staff, assistants in particular, could not be indefinitely postponed; considerations of this kind caused efforts to be made in nearly every country to formulate new regulations governing the status of the teaching staff. In the case of the countries to which democracy had recently been restored, the desire to harmonise the status of their teachers with democratic government was a further incentive.

As a result, some countries now have texts while others are still at the stage of comprehensive or partial drafts: in France, there is the decree on assistants and the teacher status; in Spain, a scheme for university reform is under way, including provisions relating to teachers; in Italy the vicissitudes of university reform schemes turn largely on the problems of staff status; in Portugal, numerous draft regulations are in preparation. In Greece and Turkey the question seems to be less topical, although the system of new universities does appear to be having some effect on the status of the teaching staff.

55. It is extremely difficult to present a composite picture of the trends revealed in the texts, whether applicable or in draft form. It is possible only to indicate the general trends:

- Academic freedom is a theme that runs through nearly all of them. It is not just a question of granting teachers freedom enjoyed by all public servants in their capacity as citizens. The freedoms are wider since higher education implies the right and duty to practise free expression both on-duty and off-duty. Similarly, while the guarantees vary, they generally include university judiciary bodies and a smaller measure of hierarchical authority than in the case of other civil servants. Job security is usually guaranteed.

- In most cases, there is a system of selection for recruitment to the university's established staff, involving the university and its administration in variable proportions - although the former has priority - and a series of examinations based on qualifications or written tests either at national level or at local level. Careers too (ie promotion, broadly speaking) depend on decisions taken either by central organs representing the universities or by the university itself.

- Order is being restored in the teacher hierarchy. But most reforms or reform schemes embody the principle of a graded hierarchy with fairly numerous steps, and institute a "career plan"; in other words, they make no provision for access to higher posts from outside and ensure that promotion prospects are fairly well-guaranteed (in Italy and France, in particular, attempts are being made to reorganise expenditure so as to give the "pyramid" of posts a more compact appearance).

- The problems of assistantship are being tackled in two ways: firstly, by conferring permanent status on assistants at present "in the doldrums" (through the creation of new posts at the higher end of the establishment table) and, secondly, by returning to clear rules, rather similar to the old rule, and applying these more stringently in future: assistantships are temporary, and assistants can be promoted to permanent posts only on the basis of scientific qualifications, failing which they must leave the university after a certain time.

- Generally, the texts and drafts enshrine the principle - not only in non-university institutes but also in the universities - that persons without a traditional university background may be recruited on the basis of their professional qualifications up to and including the rank of professor.

36. The general trend of the reforms that have been achieved or envisaged after a good deal of improvisation and delay can be deemed satisfactory on the whole both with regard to the guarantees of academic freedom and with the concern to improve the appearance of the employment "pyramid", to solve the problems inherited from the past (in particular that of the assistants) and to broaden the field of teacher recruitment. As very nearly all countries of Southern Europe are making good progress in these directions, recommendations to that effect would be out of place.

Nor would it seem fitting to envisage recommendations on administrative or technical details of complex character to which general solutions cannot be applied: for example, whether competitive examinations for the highest posts in tertiary education should be local or national; whether they should consist solely of an assessment of applicants' qualifications and experience or also include written or oral tests; or the number and level of teaching "posts" to be entered in the teaching staff establishment table etc. Each of these issues brings traditional national practice into question and it is unlikely that a uniform solution will be found for every discipline and every institute. Academic freedom, career prospects for young people, outside recruitment: these general guidelines recalled above are sufficiently precise and are already being implemented.

Recommendations can, however, be made from a fairly general standpoint, to the effect that the reforms already begun be pursued more boldly, and that over-zealous reaction to past errors be avoided.

37. The first category (continuation of reforms) could include three recommendations:

- Once the new structures of the teaching profession are outlined, a medium-term and long-term recruitment plan should be devised to prevent a recurrence of the past pattern of alternate glut and shortage. Planning should be fairly flexible so that corrective action can be taken periodically to cope with the (foreseeable) occurrence of unforeseeable events.

- Similarly, if a shortage occurs in a particular sector at a particular level, it should be coped with by provisional measures (ad hoc pedagogical measures, enlistment of persons outside the university etc) rather than by hasty recruitment which can only condemn teaching and research to decades of vexation.

- Even if fairly large numbers of teachers with "unconventional" educational backgrounds may be admitted, even at the highest level, in no country are such personalities, whatever their qualities, integrated purely and simply on a permanent basis with all the attendant advantages and prerogatives including the retirement pension. Their integration should of course be subject to qualification requirements which leave no room for governmental or political favours; the matter could, for example, be decided by vote in the national councils representing the discipline in question. The integration should only be made permanent after a trial period.

- It would be wrong for age-limits to be set so high as to encumber the tertiary sector with older teachers, most of whom no longer have inventive minds, thereby slowing down the intake of younger elements. But retired teachers could be given the chance to offer their services to tertiary education, not as teachers but as invigilators or thesis supervisors; or they could relieve their serving colleagues of part of the administrative work-load.

58. The second category of recommendations would serve the purpose of preventing some of the current reforms from running out of control.

The main aim must be to keep teachers' careers free from the "civil service mentality". Here, there are two pitfalls to be avoided. The first is that of allowing access to the highest posts only to people who have climbed up through all the lower grades and stayed a long time in each. Any compulsory course of that kind would be likely to deter highly qualified persons - as has been known to happen in some of the disciplines that are not purely scientific - and make them prefer more glamorous careers in the public or private sectors.

The second pitfall would consist in yielding to pressure from persons in the lower-grade posts, and applying the traditional civil service rule that promotion shall be based on seniority and an administrative assessment of past performance. Scientific and pedagogic qualifications should be the essential criteria for access to the highest posts.

SECTION II - The students

59. The problems encountered in the countries of Southern Europe with regard to teachers recur with the same striking similarity where the students are concerned; here, the problems are more important because they affect more persons, involve whole families and have repercussions on the economic and political well-being of the countries concerned.

The fact that student numbers are rising and that many students embark on courses in no way connected with the needs of the economy is certainly not a feature specific to Southern Europe; it is associated with factors that are in themselves positive such as the development of the education system in general, secondary education in particular, and, more generally, higher living standards. Nor does Southern Europe have a monopoly of graduate unemployment and other problems resulting from the worsening economic crisis.

Nevertheless, it must be admitted that, to a not negligible degree, the difficulties created by the massive influx of students and of the unsuitable courses to which they are directed are felt more keenly in Southern Europe than elsewhere. The numerous causes responsible for this situation have already been reported.

For example, diplomas in those countries have by tradition a particular social and psychological status (see above, paragraph 12) which makes competition for university entrance particularly vigorous. Also, frequent delays in the setting up of non-tertiary courses of training leading to occupations and parallel delays in the diversification of tertiary education have added to this pressure and at the same time channelled the flow towards the traditional avenues of education where overcrowding is already chronic. Lastly, for reasons connected with the political background of the countries under review, the student body has become involved in political skirmishes as both actor and object.

60. Four features sum up the situation in Southern Europe although with greater accuracy for some countries than for others:

- The first feature is the enormous increase in the student population until the levelling-off tendency began two or three years ago, in the countries where university entrance remained free. Details are given in the national reports.

- The second feature is the difficulty experienced in providing students with proper guidance; this is due partly to inadequate diversification and the lower prestige of the new study courses, and partly to the resistance on the part of students who are drawn towards the traditional courses either because they lead to better-paid occupations or simply because they satisfy a "southern" liking for law, the humanities and political science.

- The third is the drop-out and failure rate (in some if not all countries); the result is a drop in the number of graduates, as well as a drop in performance on the part of the establishments in question, so that the impression is given that the resources available for tertiary education are not wisely used.

- The fourth and last feature is graduate unemployment. This is a complicated phenomenon chiefly because it varies from country to country but also because it has been masked in recent years by the economic crisis which makes it impossible to draw a clear dividing-line between the temporary and the structural. Unemployment among young graduates does, however, seem to have certain specific features: there is less unemployment among young graduates than among young non-graduates; but a high proportion of them are forced to accept jobs for which they are over-qualified, which means that their job satisfaction and remuneration both suffer.

61. These considerations give particular prominence to the problem of free university entrance. The original situation in the countries under review varied considerably.

In the two most populated countries, France and Italy, the principle used to be that access to the non-university sector (very important in France) was by examination and that possession of a diploma giving evidence of successful completion of secondary education was sufficient for university entrance. Spain has experienced variations in rules of access, but in 1972 the former semi-selective system was relaxed. Portugal practised different systems according to the vicissitudes of political life. In Greece and Turkey, university entrance was subject to a form of planning at national level.

Incidentally, the term "selection" covers a multitude of sins. There may be selection of a kind even when there is officially none, as when a difficult first-year university course provides an opportunity for some vigorous weeding. This was in fact the case in France before 1968 and in Spain before 1972. Selection may be lenient, as when the purpose is to verify standards of attainment without any numerus clausus (although it is true that entrance examinations readily become competitive). Selection may be made within each university or at national level. The results of pre-tertiary schooling, or marks in special examinations and tests, may be variously appreciated.

The apparently simple issue of selection or non-selection is clouded by two further factors, the first being the existence of financial aid to students: this practice is fairly well-developed in the countries of Southern Europe and it has been successful to some extent in making tertiary education widely accessible. The second is the existence of special university entrance examinations or tests for students who do not meet the normal secondary education requirements.

62. The present-day trends where this problem is concerned are fairly clear in Southern Europe. The public generally, especially the younger generation and families, dislikes selection, campaigns for its abolition where it exists and against its introduction where it does not. The authorities, the civil service especially, and most teachers favour at least a moderate form of selection, the former for financial reasons and for fear of frustration among the young unemployed, the latter for reasons of scientific or pedagogical effectiveness. Where selection is practised it tends to remain, and where it is not it is creeping in.

The trend in Portugal is definitely towards a selective system. France and Italy, although apparently bastions of non-selection, are in fact introducing a kind of selection in devious ways. For instance, selection is virtually inevitable for access to the medical faculties for practical reasons (the limited number of hospital beds for clinical training, and the resistance of the medical profession to any massive influx of new practitioners). Similarly, selection is

practised for entry into the "third cycle" because of the need to maintain the minimum requirements for research. France, for its part, has found a devious but effective way of introducing selection and guidance by permitting the universities themselves to decide on a numerus clausus and make their own arrangements for selecting the requisite number of students (upper-secondary examination results, "first come first served", or the drawing of lots). For the time being, the nationwide capacity of the French universities being what it is, there is little likelihood of any candidate being turned down by all of them, but some may have to leave home or change their original study plans in order to find places.

Political and social upheavals apart, it looks as though the practice of selection will spread, although how openly and for how long is uncertain.

63. Where there is selection there is also guidance. Guidance takes two forms: either the criteria of selection vary according to the type of study the applicant prefers, or the results of an entrance examination permit the successful candidates to choose which establishment they will enter.

There may be guidance even when there is no selection, as in the case of a requirement that a candidate's secondary education should be relevant to his proposed field of study at the tertiary level. Failure, too, can be a form of guidance, in so far as a student with a record of failure in a particular discipline can change to another area of study.

Obviously, the opportunities for guidance are very much affected by the extent to which tertiary education is diversified. The more diversified the avenues of study, the greater the possibilities for guidance.

64. Should the question of adult education and its various aspects (free-access university, continuing and in-service training) be discussed here or in the next chapter on diversification? It is a very important question. Adult education enables persons eliminated by poverty or selection not to give up all hope of entering the tertiary education sector; it is also an important vehicle of democratisation in opening permanent oppportunities for culture and/or vocational qualification to people in jobs.

In all the countries considered, or nearly all, it is one of the aims of tertiary education to offer access to working adults. Some countries have gone further than others in this respect. France seems to be taking the lead: legislation has been enacted to oblige employers to make a financial contribution and grant special leave to their employees, while at the same time the tertiary education sector has been encouraged, with some success, to provide facilities for continuing training. But every country of Southern Europe is taking the matter seriously and a number of projects are getting under way.

65. On the question of recommendations in regard to the issues discussed above, the first point to make is that guidance is a good thing in itself and selection a last resort. Imagine a society with far fewer restrictions and a plentiful supply of money and teachers: it seems fairly obvious that such a society would devote as much effort as possible to guidance, especially as it would be able to diversify its tertiary education sector so widely as to admit all but a small minority of intellectually or mentally disabled persons- on the other hand there would be no reason to practise selection at all as the society's economic prosperity would create a need to provide the majority of its members with tertiary training and enable them to satisfy their cultural aspirations regardless of whether their courses of study would bring any economic benefit.

In a situation where the resources available for tertiary education are in short supply and where different countries have reached different stages of economic development, it is difficult to see how a stand can be made for or against selection as an aid to organisation in the tertiary sector; the fact that it is avowedly a last-resort measure means that it should be used in moderation and with caution.

- Firstly, there should be as much diversification as possible, in order to reduce the need for selection, if not to eliminate it completely. It is common for optimistic ministers of education (or of university affairs) to say not that there are too many students but that they are not given proper guidance. The statement may not be strictly accurate, but contains a good deal of truth none the less.

- Selection must not make for greater social inequality. Even where pre-tertiary education and study grants are widely available, it is well-known that access to higher education, examination success and career opportunities still depend to a large extent on the social and financial situation of the student's family. Without actually incorporating a system for remedying social handicaps in the competitive examinations and tests giving access to higher education, there should be - in addition to the normal admission procedures - special "second chance" procedures for suitable candidates who have not followed the traditional courses, at least while the principle of equal chances in secondary education is still not a reality.

- Exclusion from higher education should never be seen as a life-long sentence. The development of an effective system of permanent education is one of the most reliable means of relieving the individual frustration and social tension engendered by a system of selection.

- Lastly, certain measures external to tertiary education as such might relieve the bitterness caused by selection: pre-tertiary education could be diversified to give people without experience of tertiary education a better chance of finding desirable employment; recruitment and promotion procedures in the private sector, and especially in the public sector, could take less account of paper qualifications and make a break with the "tchin" system, now all too common in the civil service and gaining ground even in industry.

## CHAPTER V

## DIVERSIFICATION

66. Diversification will not be considered in this chapter as an issue distinct from those discussed in previous chapters. It is implicit in each one in so far as its features among the ends and means of tertiary education, accounts for the most important structural changes, and has very important implications for teachers and students. This chapter on diversification will therefore contain numerous references to previous chapters.

The introduction to this report (see paragraph 4) contains a reference to the terms in which diversification was defined in the foreword to the report published by the Working Party for Northern Europe. After stating that classical systems of higher education cannot fulfil the various individual or social demands, the text describes diversification as being characterised by

- "a greater range of options varying as to purposes and levels"

which implies:

- "a clear distinction between the various goals of tertiary education (and of education as such),
- the creation of a diversity of institutions and of courses in tertiary education fulfilling both the individual educational demands and the educational needs of society,
- diversification of admission to the various courses and institutions,
- an integrated policy of planning, development and reform covering the whole diversified system of tertiary education".

67. In the past, most of the countries under review identified higher education almost wholly with university education as divided between the faculties. True, no country was without non-university institutes of tertiary education, but (again in most cases) fewer students attended such institutes and their image and role as training grounds for society's leaders were very much less prominent than those attributed to the university.

But the university, generally divided into faculties, offered traditional courses leading to degrees of various classes in very wide-ranging disciplines (law, philosophy, arts etc). In other words, ten years ago very little progress had been made in diversification, and this may be one way in which most countries of Southern Europe differ from those of Northern Europe where a very thorough-going programme of diversification had been accomplished especially for the training of technicians for industry and commerce. This may be one reason why, in this field in particular, Southern Europe resembles a building under construction whose separate parts are very difficult to fit into a coherent whole because of the need (mentioned earlier) to take account of those reforms which have

France, however, is a special case. What distinguishes it from the rest is that two systems have been in existence side by side for a very long time: the university system and that of the "grandes écoles" and "moyennes écoles"; the latter, unlike their counterparts in other countries, out-distanced the universities in prestige and social influence, more so after the university crisis of 1968. Even so, the "écoles" in France did not cover all the areas of training left open as a result of the university's entrenchment in the traditional sector, so that the opportunities for training offered by both sectors put together were insufficient. Also, such diversification as existed could not be called rational, planned or even co-ordinated. In short, for reasons that did not apply to Southern Europe as a whole, France had not achieved a high degree of diversification twelve or so years ago.

68. Thus we can see that the endeavours that have been going on for the past twenty years to achieve diversification have had little in the way of advanced structures to work on. They have been tentative and have had to make every allowance for opposition not only within the existing teaching profession but also among the general public. It is sometimes difficult to determine how much importance the education authorities have attached to diversification. France since 1969 and Portugal in recent years seem to have been the most determined in this respect probably because they are the two countries where circumstances have created the need for sweeping university reforms. Even so, the process of diversification now seems to be well under way in the other countries of Southern Europe.

The techniques of diversification have been extremely varied but each country has employed them simultaneously if not to the same extent. The techniques of diversification fall into two categories.

One of the two categories is what one might call "diversification in space" which means that the objectives of tertiary education, considered in terms of the courses offered, are made to multiply; the term "diversification in space" should conjure up a picture of an expanding construction site on which more and more houses of increasingly varied design have to be built. Then there is "diversification in time" which of course combines with diversification in space and consists of adjusting course duration to the desired objectives.

69. The simplest form of diversification <u>in space</u> consisted in the introduction of new courses in the existing universities; either specialised courses were set up inside an existing training programme - most of which ended up as courses in their own right - or training was offered of a type not formerly provided by the universities. In all countries, the headings under which the various avenues of study could be classified grew considerably in number, as did the titles of the diplomas issued. There is no evidence that this technique of diversification in space was very productive. In the first place, being inserted into highly traditional structures, many such innovations appear to have been stifled. Also, the universities had never developed very strong links with industry, that is to say the employers, and so the new courses were seldom able to gain recognition on the labour market.

This could well have been the reason why another technique was thought to be more conducive to diversification, namely that of new universities (in Turkey, Greece and Portugal, for example). The creation of new universities does not simply reflect a will to increase the number of universities or improve their general country-wide distribution. The idea seems also to have been that the creation of such establishments enables the public authorities to make diversification take root in ground more favourable to innovation: hence the fact that most new universities have little or no provision for the traditional disciplines and are organised along lines that are not necessarily those of the older universities. In this way the need to retain the university pattern is reconciled with the need for new objectives and the practice of new teaching methods.

But the same does not apply to all countries: for example in France (except for a few special cases of which the Technical University of Compiègne is one) and in Italy, the new universities have been created more or less on the model of the old ones.

A third spatial diversification technique consists in promoting or creating establishments formerly having marginal status in relation to higher education as such, and giving them more ambitious objectives, setting higher standards for them and raising their resources to a level equivalent to that of universities. This, broadly speaking, is the situation in all countries, whether the establishments in question are called schools, institutes, "écoles", colleges or academies. But there are two distinct tendencies: the first is that of the majority of countries, where the aim is to maintain a reasonably "unitary" system and not to divide tertiary education into two quite separate sectors. The other tendency is that of France in which the dual system of universities and "écoles" has been maintained and probably accentuated. There are, however, new establishments ("Instituts Universitaires de Technologie"; "lycées techniques") which have characteristics of each model and so bridge the gap between the two.

Thus the effects and extent of diversification in space will plainly depend on the technique adopted. Practised in the university framework, diversification generally aims to develop or create new disciplines; outside that framework, the concern is usually to set up new courses of vocational training.

70. Diversification in time also falls into three main categories:

- The first is of concern to tertiary education only negatively, on account of the "deterrent" effect described earlier. The pre-tertiary sector is augmented by satisfactory training courses qualifying students for employment without their entering the tertiary sector. The French version of this is the "lycée technique" where students stay for a further two years after the baccalauréat to study for a professional diploma. This type of education is tertiary in content but pre-tertiary in form.

- The second type of diversification in time consists in the institution of short cycles of two years' duration and is practised very widely in the countries under review. In all cases (with the exception of the French DEUG and the Spanish colleges - which are not genuine short cycles because very few students leave off study after

completing them successfully) these are courses of vocational training offered outside the university system proper or at least not in the traditional framework. They are essential to the diversification campaign in so far as they fill an obvious economic need, for the economy cannot be peopled exclusively with generals or colonels trained over long periods or with ordinary soldiers or corporals having only pre-tertiary training. Also the fact that training is confined to two years makes for useful deployment of financial resources and cuts down the wastage of unduly prolonged periods of study. Lastly, this type of training appeals to fairly large numbers of students of average ability who would not be at ease in courses of a less concrete nature. (The short cycles, by definition, are not designed for theoretical studies, but this common-sense observation is not always heeded.)

Nevertheless, short cycles are not a panacea and our experience of them will have to be carefully studied so that the necessary corrective action can be taken when results more extensive than those now known become available. The main difficulties are these:

- It is very difficult to design a short cycle suited to the requirements of employment, as the statistics on graduate employment show. "Slots" and "levels" have to be made to coincide. A "slot" is a branch of employment in which jobs are available. "Level" refers to the compatability of the trainee's qualifications, after two years of study, with the requirements of one of those jobs. Misjudge the slot, and trainees will find themselves qualified for jobs that do not exist or are in very short supply. Misjudge the level, and diploma-holders will be regarded by employers as either too expensive or under-trained. A survey of the job-seeking experience of French IUT trainees shows a 95% success rate in some disciplines, and a comparable failure rate in others.

- The second difficulty, an extension of the first, is that, by definition, the diploma obtained as a result of a short cycle is fairly specialised and its holder can command only a rather narrow vocational field. But technological fluctuations lead to unforeseeable expansion in some occupations and recession elsewhere. An occupation in which job opportunities are plentiful at one moment can well become a sector of unemployment soon afterwards. In fact, once the momentum is gathered, it is not unusual for people to go on being trained for trades which, although formerly lacking in qualified personnel, cease to hold out any prospect after the first vacancies are filled, because it will be a whole generation before new vacancies are created by normal retirements. In view of the need for retraining that may affect numerous short-cycle graduates, and the difficulties which specialisation creates for retraining, it is essential that the short cycles be augmented by a system of permanent training. (More about this later.)

- Lastly, there is a tendency in all countries for persons graduating from short cycles to seek admission to a long cycle - a university course, for example - in order to acquire a diploma of a higher standard, thereby making up for what many of them see as their original failure to meet the long-cycle entry requirements. This is

the most awkward problem of all. In the interests of short-term effectiveness these "flyovers" which prevent the short cycles from fulfilling their proper purpose by "diverting the traffic" as it were, should be banned in all but some very exceptional cases. But while it is hard enough to maintain and explain selection based on the idea that a student must have sufficient qualifications upon entering his course, it is harder still to justify a student's exclusion on the grounds that he has completed some other course successfully: education cannot be rationed to that extent. A fairly satisfactory solution to this dilemma would probably be to regulate transit between short and long cycles, instead of taking it for granted, and - once again - to institute a system of permanent or in-service training for the benefit of the genuinely motivated student who has set his heart on a course of higher education.

The third method of diversification in time concerns the opening of universities to adults. This can take various forms:

- The first consists simply in allowing "free entry" to anyone over a certain age. This does not seem to be a widespread practice in the countries under review, precisely because it removes the basic instrument of selection. It is in fact a "luxury"; however desirable on grounds of human fulfilment, it does not head the list of priorities for the allocation of available resources.

- The second is the institution of special timetables, study periods and forms of teaching for students who earn their living by working. But in fact, these special arrangements are not in themselves conducive to diversification.

- Lastly, the most effective and most desirable form of diversification in time is that of continuing or permanent training which, in its most highly developed form, involves labour legislation on the one hand and the organisation of tertiary education on the other. Its numerous advantages have already been described. It is a genuine vehicle of diversification since it can be made to serve a cultural need or professional ambition, as required. The costs, which can be shared by the employers and the persons concerned, need not be excessive. Furthermore, it provides an opportunity for the training institutes to discuss with users how best to meet their needs, and it is conceivable that new courses or teaching methods will be developed as a result of this dialogue.

71. But as we have seen, and as the Working Party for Northern Europe has shown, diversification does not consist simply in finding the time and space for courses of tertiary education and distributing them like lottery tickets to satisfy individual demands and special needs. It cannot exist unless the institutes, courses etc are co-ordinated as economically and coherently as possible.

Professor DE MOOR's report on relationships between curricula and diplomas is of particular relevance here, and the reader is referred to his study of curricula patterns and co-ordination.

To add a remark on Southern Europe, the point must be made that in the university framework the various countries have adopted a sequential pattern divided into cycles, each cycle leading to a diploma. On the other hand, there is considerable variety as regards non-university tertiary education with the specific problem of transit from short courses to long courses.

Harmonisation of curricula is inconceivable precisely because of the concept of diversification. But where similar subjects are taught in different ways by establishments of various categories, it would be possible for co-ordinating bodies to ensure that purely random distortions do not occur and thus facilitate the transit of students between different elements of the system, to permit where appropriate, the publication of scientific or technical literature at reasonable costs; furthermore - and this is important if diversification is to be a psychological success - such co-ordination could ensure that a course in a particular subject is not held cheap in one section of the community and prized highly in another.

72. On the subject of diversification, the following recommendations could be made, leaving aside those arising out of the considerations in previous chapters:

- It is encouraging that, with the progression of university reform in the countries considered, diversification is one of the major themes, if not the main one.

- It would be helpful if the reform measures for the achievement of diversification, once they are carefully planned and implemented, could be followed by a period of stability so that they have adequate opportunity to become known, tried and tested.

- It is certainly up to each country to decide in the light of its general education system and its own specific options, what links should exist between diversified university education and diversified non-university education, but there must be permanent co-ordination in respect of objectives, teaching methods and curricula between the various branches of tertiary education.

- Public prejudice for or against one or other branch of tertiary education must be overcome by means of an information campaign.

- Short cycles constitute one of the essential vehicles of diversification in tertiary education. Their success depends on a precise knowledge of the occupational "slots", the level that must be attained in each course and a forward-looking study of job opportunities in the medium term.

- Another key to diversification consists in offering tertiary education to adults. For this, social legislation must be enacted making it possible in practice for working men and women to take up tertiary education at certain periods in their lives, and courses suited to individual demand and the needs of the economy must be organised by the educational establishments in conjunction with the trade unions and the employers' organisations.

- Provision must be made for transit from one branch of tertiary education to the other, and from a short cycle to a long cycle, so that the training acquired in the former may be developed to the full in the new course of study; however, transit facilities must not be taken for granted, nor should a situation arise in which certain avenues of training are designed primarily to lead on to other courses.

## CONCLUSION

73. By way of conclusion, the recommendations made earlier in this report under various headings will be recapitulated and a general comment added on certain factors specific to some of the countries under consideration.

74. The goals and functions of tertiary education

a. Like the education system as a whole, tertiary education is both an end and a means of development, one being as essential as the other. But at a particular time or on a particular point in development strategy a conflict may arise between the needs of this or that economic or social sector and those of the education system, particularly at tertiary level. It is impossible to recommend in abstracto or a priori that a choice be made in this or that direction; but there can be no effective policy for the education system unless it is decided clearly and precisely what proportion of national resources can be allocated in the medium-term to the education system and, within that system, to tertiary education.

b. Tertiary education has to meet a very substantial need for mass education, and that is one of the reasons why it should be diversified in its organization, methods and aims. This diversification should make it possible to reconcile the wish of students to study subjects which appeal to them and contribute to their self-fulfilment with society's demand that courses be designed to lead to useful employment.

This reconciliation (as well as that which may prove necessary between general education and specialized vocational training, which are both tasks for tertiary education) should also be sought in the curricula of every tertiary establishment, not through any superficial tagging-on of subjects to courses but through the inclusion of fundamental subjects that are relevant to existing courses and are calculated to demonstrate their scientific basis and economic and social implications.

c. In tertiary education, there is no conflict of principle between teaching and research but, on the contrary, a natural link.

In the first place, any tertiary-level teacher should have the necessary time and facilities to seek information that will enable him to keep abreast of the latest developments in whatever subject he teaches. Moreover, even though tertiary education cannot monopolise research in the strict sense, in the creation of new knowledge, it should play a leading role in the research field. This role should itself vary from one establishment to another.

d. As regards universities and possibly, according to the country, other tertiary education establishments with comparable aims (eg certain "Grandes Ecoles" in France), they should be allocated grants from the national budget or from specialised funds for the purposes of research into subjects of their own choice. Furthermore, arrangements should be made for research to be carried out according to state-approved contractual programmes with specialised public institutions or with industry. In this connection it is important that universities and other tertiary establishments should be familiar with industry's needs so as to be able to provide it with all necessary assistance in the research field as part of their scientific functions.

Accordingly, university teachers' working hours should include a certain amount of spare time not only for "information seeking" but also for pure academic research, on the understanding that the use of such time for research is a duty for teachers and should have a bearing on their careers.

e. Tertiary education institutions other than universities and university-type establishments do not have any automatic responsibility for pure research, but there is no reason why certain research tasks suited to the nature and purpose of such institutions should not be entrusted to them. Teachers at these institutions who took an active part in research might have their teaching hours adjusted to allow for their research tasks.

75. <u>The place of tertiary education in the education system as a whole</u>

- Without dismissing out of hand the distribution of functions between different ministerial departments - one dealing with pre-tertiary, the other with tertiary education - it should be recommended that the unity of conception and construction of the education system as a whole be firmly established.

- Secondary education is quite rightly expected to provide, amongst other things, vocational training leading to skilled jobs. However, none of its branches should lead to "dead ends" offering no access to tertiary education.

76. <u>The functions and mutual relations of universities and other tertiary education establishments</u>

a. Whatever the variety of its component establishments, tertiary education should form an integrated whole based on: a clear view of establishments' common objective and the division of functions between them; a political and social status that is not unreasonably inegalitarian between the various establishments, their teachers and their students; and co-ordination allowing of co-operation.

b. There should be no tertiary education establishment that is not linked to the general system of tertiary education. This means that there should be:

- a supreme decision-making body covering all tertiary education establishments;
- continuous organic consultation between all such establishments at national and regional level;
- adequate collaboration, even in some cases interpretation, between their teachers, particularly in the research field where appropriate;
- facilities for student transfer from one establishment to another, with some supervision (see paragraph 81 (q) below);
- an effort to ensure that the public or private careers offered to students from tertiary education are not affected by excessive inequalities stemming from unjustified over-estimations or under-estimations of the standard of this or that category of establishment or qualification.

77. The autonomy of universities and other tertiary-education establishments

a. The state should retain responsibility for fixing the general objectives of the tertiary education system, the volume of national resources allocated to it, the general rules concerning the structure of establishments of all kinds and their functions in the system as a whole as well as regulations governing teachers' careers.

b. Although university autonomy, which can only be partial, should not be confused with the independence of teachers (or academic freedom), which is much more significant, the maintenance of university autonomy, which in some countries is written into the Constitution, is to be commended.

In addition to the recognition of universities as legal entities, autonomy signified that the members of each one's governing bodies should be elected or at least nominated by those concerned (subject to participation by administrators in technical management) and that a university's decisions should be supervised only if the university breaks the law or disregards its regulations and functions.

Liaison between the state and universities should be maintained by means of mutual consultation, in particular through deliberative councils comprising representatives of the universities, the state and society in general.

For certain particular functions, the conclusion of contractual charters or "programme contracts" between the state and universities may be useful.

c. In the non-university sector, autonomy cannot be granted as a matter of course, especially during the initial or experimental phase. Nor can it be contemplated for all establishments in this sector; but it can be granted to some of them as a reward for prolonged success.

78. Participation

a. The general problem of participation (by research workers, students and outside individuals) would be less difficult if it were accepted that the memberships of assemblies or councils responsible for taking decisions or giving opinions could vary according to the nature of the matters dealt with. For instance, decisions or opinions by tertiary education establishments' organs concerning the appointment, careers or disciplining of teachers should emanate only from teachers equal or senior in rank. Similarly, although many people should be given opportunities to propose research subjects, the actual choice of such subjects should be confined to those with the appropriate academic qualifications.

b. The presence of "outside individuals" on a tertiary education establishment's organ may be very useful, subject to observance of the rules concerning university autonomy.

c. Student participation should enable students to express their views; it would be considerably improved if it also involved former students with personal experience of the courses of the establishment concerned as well as of their relevance to the occupational sphere.

79. Teachers

a. Once the teaching staff's structures have been settled, a medium and long-term plan should be drawn up to ensure a smooth pattern of recruitment and avoid any surpluses or shortages of teachers.

b. Any shortage at a given time should be dealt with by temporary measures rather than the hasty recruitment of poor quality staff who would jeopardise future teaching and research.

c. For certain courses it may be useful to engage people from "unconventional" backgrounds as "associate teachers". Not only that, but persons of high academic standing who have not been through the ordinary university channels might be admitted to universities as fully-fledged teachers at the highest level. However, any political or professional favouritism in this connection should be firmly guarded against by such means as securing the prior approval of a scientifically competent and independent national body for such appointments, resorting to the appointments in only exceptional cases and insisting on a probationary period before permanent status is granted.

d. Maximum age limits for teachers should not be too high, but retired teachers with the necessary ability might be kept on, if they wished, for certain duties, such as thesis supervision or assessment, examinations, special deliberations or reports.

e. A university career should not be organised on the model of the civil service career, with a number of steps which have to be climbed one by one from the beginning. It should be possible for direct access to senior teaching posts to be granted on the basis of academic criteria, research results and teaching ability, which should also be the only considerations for promotion purposes.

f. The various establishments should be made aware of status and career problems affecting their non-teaching research workers in cases where such problems are not dealt with by some other body.

g. Although teachers' careers cannot be identical or strictly parallel in all tertiary education establishments, they should be similar enough to prevent the dignity of the various categories of teachers being impaired.

80. Students

a. Even if diversification cannot make selection unnecessary in all the countries under review, it can reduce the rigours of selection by providing alternatives to overcrowded courses.

b. Selection based on the abilities of students must not aggravate social inequalities. Accordingly, at least until greater equality of opportunity has been achieved in secondary education, it is only proper to envisage ways of enabling suitable candidates who have not followed the traditional courses to enter tertiary education, whilst helping them in their choice of studies and supporting them in their work.

c. Permanent education should provide access to tertiary education for men and women who, despite already having failed to be selected for it, or for other reasons, still wish to enter it and have demonstrated their ability to benefit from it.

d. The diversification of secondary education should in itself result in the provision of vocational training leading to skilled jobs; it should also help to reduce the waiting-list for tertiary education.

e. In general, it would be desirable if formal qualifications were not considered the sole criterion for jobs but regard was had to other criteria taking fuller account of candidates' aptitude and merits.

In any event, society should recognise the equal dignity of all workers, whatever their qualifications and jobs.

81. Diversification

The foregoing recommendations were all made with an eye to the diversification of tertiary education, in accordance with the group's terms of reference. The following recommendations, more specifically concerned with diversification, may be added to them:

a. Recently, but at different times, the Southern European countries as a whole embarked on reforms in which considerable emphasis is being placed on diversification. If and when this reform movement reaches a sufficiently advanced stage in a given country, it should be suspended for a while so that lessons may be drawn from the experience gained over a long enough period and the confidence of students and families built up in the new structures and courses resulting from diversification.

b. Continuous co-ordination should be established between the various branches of tertiary education with regard to objectives, teaching methods, curricula and research.

c. A public information campaign should be conducted to overcome prejudice against this or that branch of tertiary education in relation to others.

d. "Short" courses (two or three years), which are one of the main means of diversification, cannot achieve their aims unless they are fully geared to career opportunities, meet a standard which is neither inadequate nor excessive and take account of medium-term employment prospects in the relevant occupations.

e. Dividing a "long" course (four or more years) into "cycles" is not enough to ensure that each cycle results in a qualification opening up employment opportunities. But, apart from the value of periodic evaluation of students' results, it may be very useful not to oblige all students to go right to the end of a long course in order to obtain a professionally valid qualification. Long courses (especially those lasting more than four years) may be so arranged that they are fully completed only by students who have their sights on teaching, research or highly specialised academic work; other students can be awarded a valid qualification before the final year or years of the course.

f. Another essential means of diversification, namely permanent training for adults, requires social legislation enabling employed adults to attend tertiary education establishments as well as the provision by establishments, in conjunction with employees' and employers' organisations, of courses suited to personal wishes and economic needs.

g. Opportunities should be provided for students of all ages to transfer from one branch of tertiary education to another or from a short course to a long one, particularly in order to enable previous training to be fully benefited from on the new course. But such transfers should be supervised so as to prevent some branches from being mainly used as a mere means of access to others.

o

o o

82. In conclusion, it is worth observing that, inthe case of Southern Europe, the application of theoretically valid recommendations should allow for specific factors liable to necessitate some adjustments.

In the first place, the economic and financial capability of most of the countries in the region under review are likely to make it difficult to reconcile certain interests, destroy the belief in pre-ordained harmony, and create a need for more energetic and more painful decisions when in the generally wealthier countries of Northern Europe. This applies to the proportion of national resources that can be allocated to the education system, the choices to be made within this system when allocating resources to its various sectors, and the priorities to be granted to one or other course of training. The balance between tertiary education policy and general development policy is generally more delicate in Southern Europe than in Northern Europe.

Secondly, tertiary education policy in most Southern European countries is for the time being, and perhaps for ever, much more vulnerable than in Northern Europe to general political vicissitudes and conflicts. Consensus is as difficult to obtain on education as on social policy. This introduces a further contradiction: although more desirable and more necessary than elsewhere, the energetic and sometimes painful decisions we have just mentioned are usually more difficult to put into effect. In view of this difficulty, which varies from country to country, recommendations from outside are not likely to carry much weight where government decisions are concerned. It should therefore be clear from the way they are presented that no misapprehensions are entertained as to the likelihood of this factor diminishing their effects.

Lastly, the importance of information interchange between the countries of Southern Europe on their educational research project, innovations, successes and failures, should perhaps be emphasised. In the course of its activity, the working party has been made aware of the way in which countries united not only by geographical proximity but also by a number of political, economic, social and cultural features, give importance to the contribution of each and draw more conclusions and lessons from there than from more distant models, however successful. Without wishing to encourage segregation between the regions of Europe, it is to be hoped that the findings presented above will be followed by preferential information exchanges and joint consultation of a specific kind.